

RELEASE IN PART B6

---

**From:** Mills, Cheryl D <MillsCD@state.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 19, 2012 9:12 AM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** FW: HAK likes your proposal - will call HRC later

---

**From:** Mills, Cheryl D  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 19, 2012 4:12 AM  
**To:** 'Jeffrey.Smith' [redacted]  
**Cc:** Grafeld, Margaret P  
**Subject:** Re: HAK likes your proposal - will call HRC later

B6

Dear Jeff

Thanks for your note and your kind words of condolence. It has been a hard week for the State family.

I look forward to learning your thoughts on next steps.

Cdm

---

**From:** Smith, Jeffrey H. [redacted]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 18, 2012 05:51 PM  
**To:** Mills, Cheryl D  
**Cc:** Grafeld, Margaret P  
**Subject:** HAK likes your proposal - will call HRC later

Cheryl,

I just got off the phone with Dr. Kissinger, who had been traveling in Europe. He asked me to inform you that he likes your proposal and wants to conclude an agreement before HRC leaves office. Yale will also need to be part of the negotiations, but we are working together closely.

He does not wish to bother HRC - when she has much more important matters to deal with - but will call her later when things settle down.

I do not know what the next steps are, but he asked me to call you immediately so we can get started on the agreement.

I am pleased that we are making progress.

Also, let me add my personal thoughts about the tragedy in Libya. I did not have the honor of knowing Ambassador Stevens, but I worked in L for over eight years and know how the Department deals with these losses. It is terrible, but the Secretary did a superb job of representing (and being) the finest America has to offer.

Best regards,

Jeff

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

---

**Jeffrey H. Smith**  
Partner

Arnold & Porter LLP  
555 Twelfth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20004-1206

Telephone: +   
Cell Phone:

[www.arnoldporter.com](http://www.arnoldporter.com)

B6

---

U.S. Treasury Circular 230 Notice

Any U.S. federal tax advice included in this communication (including any attachments) was not intended or written to be used, and cannot be used, for the purpose of (i) avoiding U.S. federal tax-related penalties or (ii) promoting, marketing or recommending to another party any tax-related matter addressed herein.

---

This communication may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential or exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, please note that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. Anyone who receives this message in error should notify the sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete it from his or her computer.

---

For more information about Arnold & Porter LLP, click here :  
<http://www.arnoldporter.com>

RELEASE IN PART  
B6

**From:** Lanny Davis [redacted]  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 20, 2012 3:56 PM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** The Rice Controversy: Lessons for Avoiding the Cliff

B6

**December 20, 2012**

## The Rice Controversy: Lessons for Avoiding the Cliff

**By Lanny J. Davis and Michael S. Steele**

**[http://www.huffingtonpost.com/lanny-davis/the-rice-controversy-less\\_b\\_2330456.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/lanny-davis/the-rice-controversy-less_b_2330456.html)**

While we are from different parties and political philosophies, we agree that Susan Rice was treated unfairly by the media, disrespected by Republican senators, and virtually abandoned by the White House.

Yet, there are a few valuable lessons to be gleaned from the Rice affair that both the President and the Congress can apply to avoid going over the “fiscal cliff” on January 1, 2013.

The first lesson is the need to focus on facts and not to confuse them with innuendo and partisan attacks. For example, the indisputable fact is that Ambassador Rice, appearing on behalf of the Secretary of State, delivered almost verbatim the talking points given to her by the CIA, including her use of the expression “spontaneous demonstration” associated with the anti-Muslim video demonstrations in Cairo. Still, some Republican senators blamed her rather than the CIA and the media did very little to correct the record based on the facts.

The second lesson is the need for presidential leadership. The president admirably and publicly defended Ambassador Rice – challenging Republicans to go after him instead of her. But then his White House was strangely passive when it came to correcting the misstatements about Ambassador Rice’s role and the source of those talking points. Speculation about a potential nomination of Ambassador Rice for Secretary of State was allowed to further distort the Ambassador’s role. The president should have just as publicly set the record straight and had his White House press operation backup his assertions.

Third, the issue of fundamental fairness – which resonates with most Americans, regardless of party – should have been the dominant theme in defending the ambassador. For example, the suggestion that Ambassador Rice was “soft” on Rwanda President Paul Kagame because she worked for a company that years ago sold software products and provided advice to Kagame’s government was patently unfair. So was the suggestion that somehow she was responsible for the violence against our embassy in Benghazi because two embassies were attacked by al Qaeda in 1998 when she served as an assistant secretary of state for African Affairs.

So facts, presidential leadership, and fairness should have been applied in the matter of Ambassador Rice and must be applied to the critical issue of avoiding the fiscal cliff.

First, the facts have all but been forgotten as the two sides argue over whether there should be more taxes or more spending cuts and entitlement reform. But the most important fact is at the core of the bi-partisan Simpson-Bowles Commission report: America has to have all three to get the job done or America will drown in debt and risks becoming another Greece.

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

Second, while the president may want to blame much of the stalemate on Republican ideological rigidity, especially in the House, he could still demonstrate leadership by acknowledging that just raising tax revenues on incomes over \$250,000 per year won't seriously dent the \$16 trillion debt. Moreover, if the president unilaterally endorsed Simpson-Bowles, which relies on closing tax loopholes to raise revenues, and then challenged the Republicans to join him in that endorsement, he not only would avert falling off the fiscal cliff but would be the catalyst for building the kind of consensus around big ideas expected of presidents.

And finally, the president needs to frame the whole fiscal cliff debate in the context of fairness: not just touting an increase in taxes on the wealthy in order to "pay their fair share", but the need to pay down the national debt in fairness to our children and grand-children instead of continuing the immoral act of passing along our credit card receipts for them to pay.

In his 1961 inaugural address, President Kennedy famously challenged all Americans, not just the wealthy, to "Ask not what the country can do for you – ask what you can do for your country."

By presenting the facts, showing leadership, and demanding fairness, the president and responsible GOP leaders can come together – as presidents and congresses have in the past for our generation – to lessen the financial burden on future generations and to ask everyone to share in the responsibility of putting the national interest first. It is not only the right public policy and ultimately smart politics for both parties in congress and the White House, it is the right thing to do.

###

Mr. Davis, former special counsel to President Clinton, is a Democratic contributor for Fox News Channel. Mr. Steele, former chairman of the Republican National Committee, is a Republican political analyst for MSNBC. Both are partners in a public affairs/strategic communication firm, "Purple Nation Solutions."

This message was sent to [hdr22@clintonemail.com](mailto:hdr22@clintonemail.com) from:

Lanny J. Davis & Associates LLC | 655 Fifteenth Street, NW Suite 810 | Washington, DC 20005

**Manage Your Subscription**

Email  
Marketing  
by 

---

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal [redacted]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 13, 2012 9:47 AM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** Re: More questions. Sid

B6

Here's the ultimate Benghazi conspiracy theory that wingers believe:  
John Brennan, without a presidential finding, at the behest of the Saudis, created a covert CIA operation at the Benghazi consulate to run arms secretly to the Syrian rebels. And the administration covered it up to protect Obama in the election. In other words, a projection of Iran-contra and Watergate rolled into one.

S

-----Original Message-----

**From:** H <HDR22@clintonemail.com>  
**To:** 'sbwhoeop' [redacted]  
**Sent:** Tue, Nov 13, 2012 9:23 am  
**Subject:** Re: More questions. Sid

B6

What was his "worldview" and why would he think hurting P furthered it? Why would Cantor want to hurt P (beloved by Rs)?

---

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal [mailto:[redacted]]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 13, 2012 09:13 AM Eastern Standard Time  
**Subject:** More questions. Sid

B6

Read Washington Post report below...

More questions:

Who else in the Congress besides congressmen Reichert and Cantor knew of the Petraeus investigation before it became public? How many congressional staffers were informed? What roles did they play in deciding who to inform about it? What were their communications among themselves and with others outside their offices if any? Did any of them discuss the matter with anyone in the Romney-Ryan campaign?

Why was Cantor intent on informing FBI Director Mueller of the existence of an FBI investigation that was already resolved? Cantor would have been keenly aware that his referral put Mueller on notice that the investigation could not be contained, indeed, was already known, and put pressure on him to tell James Clapper and to make it public as soon as possible.

What were the internal discussions between Cantor and his staff on his referral to Mueller?

Did Cantor refer the matter to Mueller in order to punish the rogue FBI agent, who informed Reichert and Cantor? If not, why not?

Did Cantor understand that the FBI agent was acting illegally? Is that why he did not leak the matter to the press and instead referred it to Mueller in a transparent effort to pressure him?

Did Cantor inform Speaker Boehner? Did Cantor inform Congressman Mike Rogers, chair of the House Intelligence Committee? Why did Cantor keep them in the dark? What discussions did he have with his staff or others about who not to inform, as well as who to inform?

When Mueller learned of the illegal leak to Cantor did he launch an internal investigation? Was the FBI Inspector General informed? Is there such an investigation? If not, why not?

Was the supposedly rogue FBI agent, described in the Washington Post as motivated by his "worldview," acting alone? Did he discuss the investigation with any individual either inside or outside the bureau before he went to Reichert and Cantor?

Disclosure of an espionage investigation is a felony. Will a grand jury be empaneled by the Justice Department?

When will Senator Patrick Leahy, chair of the Judiciary Committee and a former FBI agent, begin an investigation of this matter?

[http://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/petraeus-told-biographer-to-stop-harassing-family-friend-officials-say/2012/11/12/6ccb325c-2d00-11e2-a99d-5c4203af7b7a\\_story.html](http://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/petraeus-told-biographer-to-stop-harassing-family-friend-officials-say/2012/11/12/6ccb325c-2d00-11e2-a99d-5c4203af7b7a_story.html)

What remains unclear is why, after it was decided that criminal charges would not be filed, the FBI informed Clapper about the investigation. Another question is why the notification was made on Election Day about a case the Justice Department had declined to pursue weeks earlier.

At some point during the summer, the Tampa FBI agent whom Kelley had first approached for help was taken off the investigation. Frustrated and concerned that an inquiry into what he thought may be a possible national security breach had not progressed, he got in touch with the office of Rep. Dave Reichert (R-Wash.). Reichert passed the information on to House Majority Leader Eric Cantor (R-Va.).

"I was contacted by an F.B.I. employee concerned that sensitive, classified information may have been compromised and made certain Director Mueller was aware of these serious allegations and the potential risk to our national security," Cantor said in a statement.

Cantor contacted FBI Director Robert S. Mueller III on Oct. 31, and a week later Clapper told Petraeus he needed to resign.

"I don't know if it would have taken this course without Cantor," a person close to the inquiry said.

RELEASE IN PART B6

---

**From:** H <hrod17@clintonemail.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 11, 2012 11:12 PM  
**To:** Diane Reynolds  
**Subject:** Re: I'm in my office

[Redacted]

B6

Two of our officers were killed in Benghazi by an Al Queda-like group: The Ambassador, whom I handpicked and a young communications officer on temporary duty w a wife and two young children. Very hard day and I fear more of the same tomorrow.

Let's try again later.

[Redacted]

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Diane Reynolds  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 11, 2012 08:59 PM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** Re: I'm in my office

[Redacted]

----- Original Message -----

**From:** H  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 11, 2012 08:51 PM  
**To:** Diane Reynolds  
**Subject:** I'm in my office

Because of attacks on our embassy in Cairo and our office in Benghazi so email when you can talk.

RELEASE IN PART B6

---

**From:** H <hrod17@clintonemail.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, September 14, 2012 8:55 PM  
**To:** 'Russorv@state.gov'  
**Subject:** Fw: CONDOLENCE

Pls prepare response.

---

**From:** Sullivan, Jacob J [mailto:SullivanJJ@state.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2012 06:44 PM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** FW: CONDOLENCE

---

**From:** Barnett Rubin [mailto: ]  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2012 8:18 AM  
**To:** Sullivan, Jacob J  
**Subject:** Fwd: CONDOLENCE

Jake,

I received this note on Wednesday while traveling, soon after the news of the death of Chris Stevens broke. It is from Bob Bergdahl, father of Sgt. Bowe Bergdahl. Please convey it to the Secretary.

Best,

Barneu

Begin forwarded message:

---

**From:** Klaus Dahl [ ]  
**Subject:** CONDOLENCE  
**Date:** September 12, 2012 4:24:55 PM GMT+02:00  
**To:** Barnett Rubin [ ]  
**Reply-To:** Klaus Dahl [ ]

Dear Barney,

Please convey our abiding condolences to everyone in Foreign Service.

Your service is most noble and almost invisible.

Our Nation is stumbling through a very volatile world.

The "Crusade" paradigm will never be forgotten in this part of the world and we force our Diplomats to carry a lot of baggage around while walking on eggshells.

Be very careful my friend!



Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

I'm very sorry,

bob

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal <[redacted]>  
**Sent:** Friday, October 19, 2012 10:32 AM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** H: fyi. see esp point about bush. Sid

B6

CONFIDENTIAL

October 19, 2012

For: Ron Klain  
From: Sidney Blumenthal  
Re: Final debate

1. Romney will inevitably falsify, distort and mangle facts on a range of subjects from Libya to the defense budget. But why is this debate different from all other debates? In the dedicated foreign policy debate, the stakes are higher—America's role in the world. That makes Romney's errors even more consequential and potentially threatening. And that must be an essential predicate of Obama's point when he exposes Romney's falsehoods. When Romney lies on domestic policy it's shameful, but when he lies on foreign policy it's dangerous.
2. When Romney lies or distorts, he should be revealed as more than misleading. In the foreign policy debate, when Romney lies he shows that he's *unprepared*. That word—"unprepared"—is potentially lethal to him. It should be linked logically to his falsehoods, which become the proof. When you're untrue, you're unprepared, and when you're unprepared you can't be strong.
3. Romney's attack line on Libya is not only false, as exposed in the last debate. (Obama here can joke that Romney apparently wants to rerun the last debate but this time without Candy Crowley present to call him out. Romney will become angry and nonplussed.) His attack line is a reheated leftover of the Bush era attacks on Democrats designed by Karl Rove as weak on terrorism, which were themselves repackaged old Republican attacks from the Cold War. It's all nostalgia. And it's not about policy—it's only about politics and intended to obscure the realities on the ground and the truth about the matter.
4. The issue of the legacy of George W. Bush is complex. Romney has angered Republicans with his attack on George W. Bush and refusal to defend him in the last debate. (See Susan Eisenhower on her blog: <http://susaneisenhower.com/2012/10/18/what-drives-mitt-romney/#more-830> "Romney's debate answers were undoubtedly aimed at undecided voters, but many members of the Republican Party I've spoken to in the last two days are incensed by Romney's handling of the Bush question. This debate is unlikely to change the contours of the campaign, but it has offered one more glimpse at what drives the man who wants desperately to move into the White House.") Obama can make the following points: a. Of course: He has inherited two wars, one of which he has ended and

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

another that he is ending, characterizing how he has defended US interests in each case; b. After the elimination of Bin Laden, AQ is shattered, splintered and diffuse, still in spots a menace but as a central organization smashed, requiring smart, flexible and nuanced approaches to a variety of situations, not ham-handed, dogmatic and rhetorical responses like Romney proposes that can only have negative unintended consequences; c. Romney's old ideas are outdated, whose source is his advisers, who were Bush's propagandists, not really even his first-rank advisers, but his cheerleaders—not the neoconservative A-Team, but the B-Team; d. Then, really stick in the shiv by having Obama say that he was somewhat surprised that Romney in the last debate did not give President George W. Bush credit where credit is due—for example, breaking with the neoconservatives around Vice President Cheney by adopting the surge in Iraq led by current CIA director David Petraeus that prepared the groundwork for Obama's own policy in Iraq. And now we can understand, in that light, why Romney failed to acknowledge President Bush in any positive way—he's to his far right and the captive of the discredited advisers and policies that none other than Bush himself finally broke with.

5. Don't neglect to interject the economic factor as the foundation of US strength in the world. The Financial Times/Brookings Global Index reports that it is Obama's policies that are working--“the brightest spot in the world economy”—and that the ones that are not working are precisely the sort of austerity policies imposed in Europe—in fact like those advocated by Romney! Romney is the one pushing the bad austerity medicine from Europe that would ruin the recovery. Romney's policies are a European poison pill for the American recovery.

RELEASE IN PART  
B5

---

**From:** Reines, Philippe I <reinesp@state.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 22, 2013 10:09 PM  
**To:** H  
**Cc:** Mills, Cheryl D; Sullivan, Jacob J  
**Subject:** RE: | Clinton prepping for Benghazi grilling

We're writing something for you on this.

[Redacted]

B5

[Redacted]

-----Original Message-----

**From:** H [mailto:HDR22@clintonemail.com]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 22, 2013 9:46 PM  
**To:** Reines, Philippe I; Sullivan, Jacob J  
**Subject:** | Clinton prepping for Benghazi grilling

[Redacted]

B5

<http://security.blogs.cnn.com/2013/01/22/clinton-prepping-for-benghazi-grilling/>

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

RELEASE IN PART  
B6

---

**From:** H <hrod17@clintonemail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 16, 2013 5:37 PM  
**To:** 'sullivanjj@state.gov'  
**Subject:** Fw: H: Latest Libya intel; internal govt discussions high level. Sid  
**Attachments:** hrc\_memo\_libya\_internal\_govt\_011512.docx

More info.

---

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal [mailto: ]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 15, 2013 11:20 AM Eastern Standard Time  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** H: Latest Libya intel; internal govt discussions high level. Sid

B6

CONFIDENTIAL

January 15, 2013

For: Hillary  
From: Sid  
Re: Libya internal government discussions

SUBJECT: Libya (13/4)

SOURCE: Sources with direct access to the Libyan National Government, as well as the highest levels of European Governments, and Western Intelligence and security services.

1. (Source Comment: On the morning of January 15, 2013 Libyan Prime Minister Ali Zidan was informed by Interior Minister Ashour Shuwail and Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation Mohamed Abdulaziz that Italy plan to close its consulate in Benghazi and reduce the size of its embassy in Tripoli following attacks on the consulate itself and the Italian consul general. Shuwail reported that the attacks were carried out by Eastern militia forces associated with Ansar al Islam, which, although put under pressure by the National Libyan Army (NLA) following the attack on the U.S. consulate in Benghazi in September 2012, continues to operate in and around that city. Abdulaziz warned Zidan that he should expect this situation to be raised by Italian officials and the chief executive officer (CEO) of the Italian oil company ENI when the Libyan Prime Minister visits Rome in late January 2013. The Minister of Foreign Affairs added that his sources in Rome report that the Italians will repeat their willingness to take risks in starting up operations in Libya, but they will ask for evidence that the new Libyan government is taking steps to improve its ability to protect foreign workers and facilities in Benghazi, and throughout the country.

2. This individual noted that Zidan was visibly upset during the conversation, expressing frustration over this turn of events, and stating that the relationship with ENI must serve as a sign to the managers of other foreign companies that they can operate in Libya in safety under the General National Council Government (GNC). According to a very sensitive source, Zidan is concerned that these latest incidents in Benghazi, taken in combination with the January 4, 2013 assassination attempt against President Mohamed al Magariaf at the Southern town of Sabha, will convince foreign diplomats and businessmen that Libya remains in a state of chaos. Zidan and Magariaf differ on a number of policy issues, not the least of which is the relative authority of their two offices, but the Prime Minister told Shuwail that they must do everything they can to protect the life of the President if they are to maintain a stable post-revolutionary government.)

3. According to this individual, Zidan and his ministers spoke during their visit to Doha, and later discussed the matter with Libyan intelligence chief General Salim Hassi and NLA Chief of Staff General Yousef Mangoush, ordering them to take all steps necessary to deal with Ansar al Islam and its associated groups. For his part Hassi warned that Ansar al Islam has a significant following in Eastern Benghazi and in the territory between Benghazi and the Egyptian border. He and Mangoush agreed that they will step up operations in that area, noting that they also will reach out for assistance from Egypt and the Western powers in an effort to improve the training of their personnel and develop an international plan to limit the flow of illegal arms into Libya. Hassi noted that he is making progress on the issue of dealing with fighters loyal to the family of former dictator Muammar al Qaddafi, especially through cooperation with the French external intelligence service (Direction Générale de la Sécurité Extérieure – DGSE). The intelligence chief noted that French military operations against rebel forces in Mali have been valuable in this regard. Both generals agreed to follow Zidan's orders, and maintain good relations with their counterparts in Italy as well.

4. For his part Zidan, according to this source, stated that he will raise this matter in his conversations with Qatari premier, Sheikh Hamad bin Jassim bin Jaber Al-Thani, and its Foreign Minister, Sheikh Mohammed bin Nasser bin Jassim Al-Thani. Zidan will ask Qatar to assist the GNC government efforts to organize and fund a program to improve the quality of its military, police, and intelligence personnel. In the opinion of this individual Zidan plans to point out to the Qatari leaders that Libya needs their assistance to protect the victory of the revolution against Qaddafi. Zidan wants Qatar to assist in training security personnel, while also opening centers to train young Libyans to take on positions in the oil industry previously held by foreign workers.

5. (Source Comment: Prior to their departure for Doha, Mangoush and Zidan discussed the security situation and agreed that the NLA must seek assistance in tracking the movements of the independent militias, as well as the arms that are smuggled to them from Mali in the South West and South Sudan in the South East. Mangoush stated that he was in touch with the military commanders in the appropriate countries, including Egypt, and he plans to reach out to the Western powers in an effort to gain support and training. For his part Zidan complained that Magariaf should not have attended the Sabha meetings, given the strength of Qaddafi supporters in that region. Zidan added that, while he realized that the President is anxious to demonstrate that the GNC government is gaining strength throughout the country he must be realistic about the nature of the threat facing both him and the government. According to this source, Mangoush chose to avoid being drawn into this discussion of the President.)

6. According to a very sensitive source, General Hassi disagrees with the NLA analysis that the Sabha attack was not aimed at Magariaf specifically, noting that there were five prior assassination attempts against Magariaf in 2012, and that he is a target for a diverse collection of enemies, including former Qaddafi forces, groups like Ansar al Sharia, and even his political adversaries in the GNC. Accordingly, Hassi intends to establish new programs to train a detachment of presidential bodyguards, and his own anti-terrorism personnel.

**RELEASE IN PART**  
B6

---

**From:** H <hrod17@clintonemail.com>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 16, 2013 5:37 PM  
**To:** 'Russorv@state.gov'  
**Subject:** Fw: H: Latest Libya intel; internal govt discussions high level. Sid  
**Attachments:** hrc\_memo\_libya\_internal\_govt\_011512.docx

Pls print.

---

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal [mailto: ]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 15, 2013 11:20 AM Eastern Standard Time  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** H: Latest Libya intel; internal govt discussions high level. Sid

B6

CONFIDENTIAL

January 15, 2013

For: Hillary  
From: Sid  
Re: Libya internal government discussions

SUBJECT: Libya (13/4)

SOURCE: Sources with direct access to the Libyan National Government, as well as the highest levels of European Governments, and Western Intelligence and security services.

1. (Source Comment: On the morning of January 15, 2013 Libyan Prime Minister Ali Zidan was informed by Interior Minister Ashour Shuwail and Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation Mohamed Abdulaziz that Italy plan to close its consulate in Benghazi and reduce the size of its embassy in Tripoli following attacks on the consulate itself and the Italian consul general. Shuwail reported that the attacks were carried out by Eastern militia forces associated with Ansar al Islam, which, although put under pressure by the National Libyan Army (NLA) following the attack on the U.S. consulate in Benghazi in September 2012, continues to operate in and around that city. Abdulaziz warned Zidan that he should expect this situation to be raised by Italian officials and the chief executive officer (CEO) of the Italian oil company ENI when the Libyan Prime Minister visits Rome in late January 2013. The Minister of Foreign Affairs added that his sources in Rome report that the Italians will repeat their willingness to take risks in starting up operations in Libya, but they will ask for evidence that the new Libyan government is taking steps to improve its ability to protect foreign workers and facilities in Benghazi, and throughout the country.

2. This individual noted that Zidan was visibly upset during the conversation, expressing frustration over this turn of events, and stating that the relationship with ENI must serve as a sign to the managers of other foreign companies that they can operate in Libya in safety under the General National Council Government (GNC). According to a very sensitive source, Zidan is concerned that these latest incidents in Benghazi, taken in combination with the January 4, 2013 assassination attempt against President Mohamed al Magariaf at the Southern town of Sabha, will convince foreign diplomats and businessmen that Libya remains in a state of chaos. Zidan and Magariaf differ on a number of policy issues, not the least of which is the relative authority of their two offices, but the Prime Minister told Shuwail that they must do everything they can to protect the life of the President if they are to maintain a stable post-revolutionary government.)

3. According to this individual, Zidan and his ministers spoke during their visit to Doha, and later discussed the matter with Libyan intelligence chief General Salim Hassi and NLA Chief of Staff General Yousef Mangoush, ordering them to take all steps necessary to deal with Ansar al Islam and its associated groups. For his part Hassi warned that Ansar al Islam has a significant following in Eastern Benghazi and in the territory between Benghazi and the Egyptian border. He and Mangoush agreed that they will step up operations in that area, noting that they also will reach out for assistance from Egypt and the Western powers in an effort to improve the training of their personnel and develop an international plan to limit the flow of illegal arms into Libya. Hassi noted that he is making progress on the issue of dealing with fighters loyal to the family of former dictator Muammar al Qaddafi, especially through cooperation with the French external intelligence service (Direction Générale de la Sécurité Extérieure – DGSE). The intelligence chief noted that French military operations against rebel forces in Mali have been valuable in this regard. Both generals agreed to follow Zidan's orders, and maintain good relations with their counterparts in Italy as well.

4. For his part Zidan, according to this source, stated that he will raise this matter in his conversations with Qatari premier, Sheikh Hamad bin Jassim bin Jaber Al-Thani, and its Foreign Minister, Sheikh Mohammed bin Nasser bin Jassim Al-Thani. Zidan will ask Qatar to assist the GNC government efforts to organize and fund a program to improve the quality of its military, police, and intelligence personnel. In the opinion of this individual Zidan plans to point out to the Qatari leaders that Libya needs their assistance to protect the victory of the revolution against Qaddafi. Zidan wants Qatar to assist in training security personnel, while also opening centers to train young Libyans to take on positions in the oil industry previously held by foreign workers.

5. (Source Comment: Prior to their departure for Doha, Mangoush and Zidan discussed the security situation and agreed that the NLA must seek assistance in tracking the movements of the independent militias, as well as the arms that are smuggled to them from Mali in the South West and South Sudan in the South East. Mangoush stated that he was in touch with the military commanders in the appropriate countries, including Egypt, and he plans to reach out to the Western powers in an effort to gain support and training. For his part Zidan complained that Magariaf should not have attended the Sabha meetings, given the strength of Qaddafi supporters in that region. Zidan added that, while he realized that the President is anxious to demonstrate that the GNC government is gaining strength throughout the country he must be realistic about the nature of the threat facing both him and the government. According to this source, Mangoush chose to avoid being drawn into this discussion of the President.)

6. According to a very sensitive source, General Hassi disagrees with the NLA analysis that the Sabha attack was not aimed at Magariaf specifically, noting that there were five prior assassination attempts against Magariaf in 2012, and that he is a target for a diverse collection of enemies, including former Qaddafi forces, groups like Ansar al Sharia, and even his political adversaries in the GNC. Accordingly, Hassi intends to establish new programs to train a detachment of presidential bodyguards, and his own anti-terrorism personnel.



**RELEASE IN FULL****CONFIDENTIAL**

January 15, 2013

For: Hillary  
From: Sid  
Re: Libya internal government discussions

SUBJECT: Libya (13/4)

SOURCE: Sources with direct access to the Libyan National Government, as well as the highest levels of European Governments, and Western Intelligence and security services.

1. (Source Comment: On the morning of January 15, 2013 Libyan Prime Minister Ali Zidan was informed by Interior Minister Ashour Shuwail and Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation Mohamed Abdulaziz that Italy plan to close its consulate in Benghazi and reduce the size of its embassy in Tripoli following attacks on the consulate itself and the Italian consul general. Shuwail reported that the attacks were carried out by Eastern militia forces associated with Ansar al Islam, which, although put under pressure by the National Libyan Army (NLA) following the attack on the U.S. consulate in Benghazi in September 2012, continues to operate in and around that city. Abdulaziz warned Zidan that he should expect this situation to be raised by Italian officials and the chief executive officer (CEO) of the Italian oil company ENI when the Libyan Prime Minister visits Rome in late January 2013. The Minister of Foreign Affairs added that his sources in Rome report that the Italians will repeat their willingness to take risks in starting up operations in Libya, but they will ask for evidence that the new Libyan government is taking steps to improve its ability to protect foreign workers and facilities in Benghazi, and throughout the country.

2. This individual noted that Zidan was visibly upset during the conversation, expressing frustration over this turn of events, and stating that the relationship with ENI must serve as a sign to the managers of other foreign companies that they can operate in Libya in safety under the General National Council Government (GNC). According to a very sensitive source, Zidan is concerned that these latest incidents in Benghazi, taken in combination with the January 4, 2013 assassination attempt against President Mohamed al Magariaf at the Southern town of Sabha, will convince foreign diplomats and businessmen that Libya remains in a state of chaos. Zidan and Magariaf differ on a number of policy issues, not the least of which is the relative authority

of their two offices, but the Prime Minister told Shuwail that they must do everything they can to protect the life of the President if they are to maintain a stable post-revolutionary government.)

3. According to this individual, Zidan and his ministers spoke during their visit to Doha, and later discussed the matter with Libyan intelligence chief General Salim Hassi and NLA Chief of Staff General Yousef Mangoush, ordering them to take all steps necessary to deal with Ansar al Islam and its associated groups. For his part Hassi warned that Ansar al Islam has a significant following in Eastern Benghazi and in the territory between Benghazi and the Egyptian border. He and Mangoush agreed that they will step up operations in that area, noting that they also will reach out for assistance from Egypt and the Western powers in an effort to improve the training of their personnel and develop an international plan to limit the flow of illegal arms into Libya. Hassi noted that he is making progress on the issue of dealing with fighters loyal to the family of former dictator Muammar al Qaddafi, especially through cooperation with the French external intelligence service (Direction Générale de la Sécurité Extérieure – DGSE). The intelligence chief noted that French military operations against rebel forces in Mali have been valuable in this regard. Both generals agreed to follow Zidan's orders, and maintain good relations with their counterparts in Italy as well.

4. For his part Zidan, according to this source, stated that he will raise this matter in his conversations with Qatari premier, Sheikh Hamad bin Jassim bin Jaber Al-Thani, and its Foreign Minister, Sheikh Mohammed bin Nasser bin Jassim Al-Thani. Zidan will ask Qatar to assist the GNC government efforts to organize and fund a program to improve the quality of its military, police, and intelligence personnel. In the opinion of this individual Zidan plans to point out to the Qatari leaders that Libya needs their assistance to protect the victory of the revolution against Qaddafi. Zidan wants Qatar to assist in training security personnel, while also opening centers to train young Libyans to take on positions in the oil industry previously held by foreign workers.

5. (Source Comment: Prior to their departure for Doha, Mangoush and Zidan discussed the security situation and agreed that the NLA must seek assistance in tracking the movements of the independent militias, as well as the arms that are smuggled to them from Mali in the South West and South Sudan in the South East. Mangoush stated that he was in touch with the military commanders in the appropriate countries, including Egypt, and he plans to reach out to the Western powers in an effort to gain support and training. For his part Zidan complained that Magariaf should not have attended the Sabha meetings, given the strength of Qaddafi supporters in that region. Zidan added that, while he realized that the President is anxious to demonstrate that the GNC government is gaining strength throughout the country he must be realistic about the nature of the threat facing both him and the government. According to this source, Mangoush chose to avoid being drawn into this discussion of the President.)

6. According to a very sensitive source, General Hassi disagrees with the NLA analysis that the Sabha attack was not aimed at Magariaf specifically, noting that there were five prior assassination attempts against Magariaf in 2012, and that he is a target for a diverse collection of enemies, including former Qaddafi forces, groups like Ansar al Sharia, and even his political adversaries in the GNC. Accordingly, Hassi intends to establish new programs to train a detachment of presidential bodyguards, and his own anti-terrorism personnel.

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 15, 2013 11:21 AM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** H: Latest Libya intel; internal govt discussions high level. Sid  
**Attachments:** hrc\_memo\_libya\_internal\_govt\_011512.docx

B6

CONFIDENTIAL

January 15, 2013

For: Hillary  
From: Sid  
Re: Libya internal government discussions

SUBJECT: Libya (13/4)

SOURCE: Sources with direct access to the Libyan National Government, as well as the highest levels of European Governments, and Western Intelligence and security services.

1. (Source Comment: On the morning of January 15, 2013 Libyan Prime Minister Ali Zidan was informed by Interior Minister Ashour Shuwail and Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation Mohamed Abdulaziz that Italy plan to close its consulate in Benghazi and reduce the size of its embassy in Tripoli following attacks on the consulate itself and the Italian consul general. Shuwail reported that the attacks were carried out by Eastern militia forces associated with Ansar al Islam, which, although put under pressure by the National Libyan Army (NLA) following the attack on the U.S. consulate in Benghazi in September 2012, continues to operate in and around that city. Abdulaziz warned Zidan that he should expect this situation to be raised by Italian officials and the chief executive officer (CEO) of the Italian oil company ENI when the Libyan Prime Minister visits Rome in late January 2013. The Minister of Foreign Affairs added that his sources in Rome report that the Italians will repeat their willingness to take risks in starting up operations in Libya, but they will ask for evidence that the new Libyan government is taking steps to improve its ability to protect foreign workers and facilities in Benghazi, and throughout the country.

2. This individual noted that Zidan was visibly upset during the conversation, expressing frustration over this turn of events, and stating that the relationship with ENI must serve as a sign to the managers of other foreign companies that they can operate in Libya in safety under the General National Council Government (GNC). According to a very sensitive source, Zidan is concerned that these latest incidents in Benghazi, taken in combination with the January 4, 2013 assassination attempt against President Mohamed al Magariaf at the Southern town of Sabha, will convince foreign diplomats and businessmen that Libya remains in a state of

chaos. Zidan and Magariaf differ on a number of policy issues, not the least of which is the relative authority of their two offices, but the Prime Minister told Shuwail that they must do everything they can to protect the life of the President if they are to maintain a stable post-revolutionary government.)

3. According to this individual, Zidan and his ministers spoke during their visit to Doha, and later discussed the matter with Libyan intelligence chief General Salim Hassi and NLA Chief of Staff General Yousef Mangoush, ordering them to take all steps necessary to deal with Ansar al Islam and its associated groups. For his part Hassi warned that Ansar al Islam has a significant following in Eastern Benghazi and in the territory between Benghazi and the Egyptian border. He and Mangoush agreed that they will step up operations in that area, noting that they also will reach out for assistance from Egypt and the Western powers in an effort to improve the training of their personnel and develop an international plan to limit the flow of illegal arms into Libya. Hassi noted that he is making progress on the issue of dealing with fighters loyal to the family of former dictator Muammar al Qaddafi, especially through cooperation with the French external intelligence service (Direction Générale de la Sécurité Extérieure – DGSE). The intelligence chief noted that French military operations against rebel forces in Mali have been valuable in this regard. Both generals agreed to follow Zidan's orders, and maintain good relations with their counterparts in Italy as well.

4. For his part Zidan, according to this source, stated that he will raise this matter in his conversations with Qatari premier, Sheikh Hamad bin Jassim bin Jaber Al-Thani, and its Foreign Minister, Sheikh Mohammed bin Nasser bin Jassim Al-Thani. Zidan will ask Qatar to assist the GNC government efforts to organize and fund a program to improve the quality of its military, police, and intelligence personnel. In the opinion of this individual Zidan plans to point out to the Qatari leaders that Libya needs their assistance to protect the victory of the revolution against Qaddafi. Zidan wants Qatar to assist in training security personnel, while also opening centers to train young Libyans to take on positions in the oil industry previously held by foreign workers.

5. (Source Comment: Prior to their departure for Doha, Mangoush and Zidan discussed the security situation and agreed that the NLA must seek assistance in tracking the movements of the independent militias, as well as the arms that are smuggled to them from Mali in the South West and South Sudan in the South East. Mangoush stated that he was in touch with the military commanders in the appropriate countries, including Egypt, and he plans to reach out to the Western powers in an effort to gain support and training. For his part Zidan complained that Magariaf should not have attended the Sabha meetings, given the strength of Qaddafi supporters in that region. Zidan added that, while he realized that the President is anxious to demonstrate that the GNC government is gaining strength throughout the country he must be realistic about the nature of the threat facing both him and the government. According to this source, Mangoush chose to avoid being drawn into this discussion of the President.)

6. According to a very sensitive source, General Hassi disagrees with the NLA analysis that the Sabha attack was not aimed at Magariaf specifically, noting that there were five prior assassination attempts against Magariaf in 2012, and that he is a target for a diverse collection of enemies, including former Qaddafi forces, groups like Ansar al Sharia, and even his political adversaries in the GNC. Accordingly, Hassi intends to establish new programs to train a detachment of presidential bodyguards, and his own anti-terrorism personnel.

**RELEASE IN FULL**

## CONFIDENTIAL

January 15, 2013

For: Hillary  
From: Sid  
Re: Libya internal government discussions

SUBJECT: Libya (13/4)

SOURCE: Sources with direct access to the Libyan National Government, as well as the highest levels of European Governments, and Western Intelligence and security services.

1. (Source Comment: On the morning of January 15, 2013 Libyan Prime Minister Ali Zidan was informed by Interior Minister Ashour Shuwail and Minister of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation Mohamed Abdulaziz that Italy plan to close its consulate in Benghazi and reduce the size of its embassy in Tripoli following attacks on the consulate itself and the Italian consul general. Shuwail reported that the attacks were carried out by Eastern militia forces associated with Ansar al Islam, which, although put under pressure by the National Libyan Army (NLA) following the attack on the U.S. consulate in Benghazi in September 2012, continues to operate in and around that city. Abdulaziz warned Zidan that he should expect this situation to be raised by Italian officials and the chief executive officer (CEO) of the Italian oil company ENI when the Libyan Prime Minister visits Rome in late January 2013. The Minister of Foreign Affairs added that his sources in Rome report that the Italians will repeat their willingness to take risks in starting up operations in Libya, but they will ask for evidence that the new Libyan government is taking steps to improve its ability to protect foreign workers and facilities in Benghazi, and throughout the country.

2. This individual noted that Zidan was visibly upset during the conversation, expressing frustration over this turn of events, and stating that the relationship with ENI must serve as a sign to the managers of other foreign companies that they can operate in Libya in safety under the General National Council Government (GNC). According to a very sensitive source, Zidan is concerned that these latest incidents in Benghazi, taken in combination with the January 4, 2013 assassination attempt against President Mohamed al Magariaf at the Southern town of Sabha, will convince foreign diplomats and businessmen that Libya remains in a state of chaos. Zidan and Magariaf differ on a number of policy issues, not the least of which is the relative authority

of their two offices, but the Prime Minister told Shuwail that they must do everything they can to protect the life of the President if they are to maintain a stable post-revolutionary government.)

3. According to this individual, Zidan and his ministers spoke during their visit to Doha, and later discussed the matter with Libyan intelligence chief General Salim Hassi and NLA Chief of Staff General Yousef Mangoush, ordering them to take all steps necessary to deal with Ansar al Islam and its associated groups. For his part Hassi warned that Ansar al Islam has a significant following in Eastern Benghazi and in the territory between Benghazi and the Egyptian border. He and Mangoush agreed that they will step up operations in that area, noting that they also will reach out for assistance from Egypt and the Western powers in an effort to improve the training of their personnel and develop an international plan to limit the flow of illegal arms into Libya. Hassi noted that he is making progress on the issue of dealing with fighters loyal to the family of former dictator Muammar al Qaddafi, especially through cooperation with the French external intelligence service (Direction Générale de la Sécurité Extérieure – DGSE). The intelligence chief noted that French military operations against rebel forces in Mali have been valuable in this regard. Both generals agreed to follow Zidan's orders, and maintain good relations with their counterparts in Italy as well.

4. For his part Zidan, according to this source, stated that he will raise this matter in his conversations with Qatari premier, Sheikh Hamad bin Jassim bin Jaber Al-Thani, and its Foreign Minister, Sheikh Mohammed bin Nasser bin Jassim Al-Thani. Zidan will ask Qatar to assist the GNC government efforts to organize and fund a program to improve the quality of its military, police, and intelligence personnel. In the opinion of this individual Zidan plans to point out to the Qatari leaders that Libya needs their assistance to protect the victory of the revolution against Qaddafi. Zidan wants Qatar to assist in training security personnel, while also opening centers to train young Libyans to take on positions in the oil industry previously held by foreign workers.

5. (Source Comment: Prior to their departure for Doha, Mangoush and Zidan discussed the security situation and agreed that the NLA must seek assistance in tracking the movements of the independent militias, as well as the arms that are smuggled to them from Mali in the South West and South Sudan in the South East. Mangoush stated that he was in touch with the military commanders in the appropriate countries, including Egypt, and he plans to reach out to the Western powers in an effort to gain support and training. For his part Zidan complained that Magariaf should not have attended the Sabha meetings, given the strength of Qaddafi supporters in that region. Zidan added that, while he realized that the President is anxious to demonstrate that the GNC government is gaining strength throughout the country he must be realistic about the nature of the threat facing both him and the government. According to this source, Mangoush chose to avoid being drawn into this discussion of the President.)

6. According to a very sensitive source, General Hassi disagrees with the NLA analysis that the Sabha attack was not aimed at Magariaf specifically, noting that there were five prior assassination attempts against Magariaf in 2012, and that he is a target for a diverse collection of enemies, including former Qaddafi forces, groups like Ansar al Sharia, and even his political adversaries in the GNC. Accordingly, Hassi intends to establish new programs to train a detachment of presidential bodyguards, and his own anti-terrorism personnel.

---

**From:** H <hrod17@clintonemail.com>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 22, 2013 9:46 PM  
**To:** 'reinesp@state.gov'; 'sullivanjj@state.gov'  
**Subject:** | Clinton prepping for Benghazi grilling

<http://security.blogs.cnn.com/2013/01/22/clinton-prepping-for-benghazi-grilling/>

B5