

Transcript of John Arthur Bentel

Date: October 24, 2016

Case: Judicial Watch, Inc. -v- U.S. Department of State

Planet Depos, LLC Phone: 888-433-3767

Fax: 888-503-3767

Email: transcripts@planetdepos.com
Internet: www.planetdepos.com

Worldwide Court Reporting | Interpretation | Trial Services

		1
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
2	FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA	
3	x	
4	JUDICIAL WATCH, INC., :	
5	Plaintiff, :	
6	v. : Civil Action No.	
7	U.S. DEPARTMENT OF STATE, : 13-cv-1363(EGS)	
8	Defendant. :	
9	X	
10		
11	Videotaped Deposition of JOHN ARTHUR BENTEL	
12	Washington, DC	
13	Monday, October 24, 2016	
14	10:01 a.m.	
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20	Job No.: 121788	
21	Pages 1 - 37	
22	Reported by: Debra A. Whitehead	

	2
1	Videotaped Deposition of JOHN ARTHUR BENTEL, held
2	at the offices of:
3	
4	BAKER BOTTS, L.L.P.
5	The Warner
6	1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
7	Washington, DC 20004-2400
8	(202) 639-7700
9	
10	
11	Pursuant to notice, before Debra A. Whitehead, an
12	Approved Reporter of the United States District Court
13	and Notary Public of the District of Columbia.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

	3
1	APPEARANCES
2	ON BEHALF OF PLAINTIFF:
3	MICHAEL BEKESHA, ESQUIRE
4	JAMES F. PETERSON, ESQUIRE
5	PAUL J. ORFANEDES, ESQUIRE
6	JUDICIAL WATCH, INC.
7	425 Third Street, SW
8	Suite 800
9	Washington, DC 20024
10	(202) 646-5172
11	
12	ON BEHALF OF DEFENDANT:
13	STEVEN A. MYERS, ESQUIRE
14	MARCIA BERMAN, ESQUIRE
15	U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
16	CIVIL DIVISION
17	20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
18	Washington, DC 20530
19	(202) 514-2205
20	
21	
22	

	4
1	APPEARANCES CONTINUED
2	ON BEHALF OF DEFENDANT:
3	ALISON R. WELCHER, ESQUIRE
4	UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF STATE
5	OFFICE OF THE LEGAL ADVISOR
6	2201 C Street, NW
7	Washington, DC 20520
8	(202) 647-6371
9	
10	ON BEHALF OF THE WITNESS:
11	JAMIE R. LYNN, ESQUIRE
12	KYLE CLARK, ESQUIRE
13	BAKER BOTTS, L.L.P.
14	The Warner
15	1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
16	Washington, DC 20004-2400
17	(202) 639-7700
18	
19	
20	ALSO PRESENT:
21	DEREK FOX, Video Specialist
22	THOMAS J. FITTON, President, Judicial Watch

		5
1	CONTENTS	
2	EXAMINATION OF JOHN ARTHUR BENTEL	PAGE
3	By Mr. Bekesha	7
4		
5	ЕХНІВІТЅ	
6	(None marked)	
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		

	6	
1	PROCEEDINGS	10:00:37
2	VIDEO SPECIALIST: Here begins Tape Number	10:00:37
3	1 in the videotaped deposition of John A. Bentel in	10:00:43
4	the matter of Judicial Watch, Inc., versus U.S.	10:00:48
5	Department of State; in the United States District	10:00:53
6	Court for the District of Columbia; Civil Action	10:00:57
7	Number 13-cv-1363.	10:01:00
8	Today's date is October 24th, 2016. The	10:01:08
9	time on the video monitor is 10:01. The	10:01:13
10	videographer today is Derek Fox, representing Planet	10:01:18
11	Depos. This video deposition is taking place at	10:01:21
12	1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest, Washington, DC.	10:01:27
13	Would counsel please voice-identify	10:01:31
14	themselves and state whom they represent.	10:01:36
15	MR. BEKESHA: Michael Bekesha, on behalf	10:01:38
16	of Judicial Watch.	10:01:40
17	MR. ORFANEDES: Paul Orfanedes, Judicial	10:01:41
18	Watch.	10:01:43
19	MR. PETERSON: James Peterson, Judicial	10:01:43
20	Watch.	10:01:46
21	MR. FITTON: Tom Fitton, President,	10:01:46
22	Judicial Watch.	10:01:48

	7	
1	MR. LYNN: Jamie Lynn with Baker Botts, on	10:01:48
2	behalf of third-party deponent John Bentel.	10:01:50
3	MR. CLARK: Kyle Clark, on behalf of Baker	10:01:50
4	Botts.	10:01:54
5	MR. MYERS: Steven Myers for the State	10:01:55
6	Department and for Mr. Bentel in his official	10:01:57
7	capacity as a former State employee.	10:02:00
8	MS. BERMAN: Marcia Berman, for the State	10:02:00
9	Department.	10:02:00
10	MS. WELCHER: Alison Welcher, for the	10:02:06
11	State Department.	10:02:06
12	VIDEO SPECIALIST: The court reporter	10:02:06
13	today is Debbie Whitehead, representing Planet	10:02:07
14	Depos.	10:02:11
15	Would the reporter please swear in the	10:02:11
16	witness.	10:02:13
17	JOHN ARTHUR BENTEL,	10:02:13
18	having been duly sworn, testified as follows:	10:02:20
19	EXAMINATION BY COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF	10:02:20
20	BY MR. BEKESHA:	10:02:20
21	Q Good morning, Mr. Bentel.	10:02:24
22	A Good morning.	10:02:26

	8	
1	Q My name is Michael Bekesha. I'm an	10:02:26
2	attorney for Judicial Watch, and I'm here to ask you	10:02:28
3	some questions about one of Judicial Watch's Freedom	10:02:32
4	of Information Act lawsuits against the State	10:02:34
5	Department. Specifically, questions surrounding the	10:02:35
6	creation, purpose, and use of the Clinton e-mail.com	10:02:37
7	system by then Secretary of State Hillary Clinton	10:02:40
8	and Huma Abedin to conduct official government	10:02:43
9	business.	10:02:46
10	Before we begin, could you please state	10:02:47
11	and spell your full name, for the record.	10:02:49
12	A Full name is John Arthur Bentel. It's	10:02:51
13	spelled J-O-H-N. Arthur is A-R-T-H-U-R. Bentel,	10:02:54
14	B-E-N-T-E-L.	10:03:00
15	Q Thank you. Also before we begin, I would	10:03:02
16	like to just go over a few ground rules. Your	10:03:04
17	counsel might have already talked to you about them,	10:03:06
18	but these rules will help the deposition go a little	10:03:08
19	bit more smoothly.	10:03:10
20	If you don't hear one of my questions,	10:03:12
21	please let me know, and I'll be happy to repeat it.	10:03:14
22	If you don't understand one of my questions, also	10:03:16

	9	
1	please let me know, and I can try to make myself	10:03:19
2	clearer.	10:03:22
3	It is also important that you respond out	10:03:22
4	loud, as opposed to shaking your head or even	10:03:24
5	gestures, because the court reporter cannot record	10:03:27
6	those sorts of things.	10:03:30
7	Finally, it is important that you wait	10:03:31
8	until I'm done speaking, asking my question. If	10:03:33
9	your counsel or the State Department's attorney	10:03:36
10	makes any objections, wait until they're done	10:03:38
11	objecting. The court reporter can't get get	10:03:41
12	responses down if everybody is speaking at once.	10:03:46
13	With that out of the way, when did you	10:03:48
14	become Director of the Executive Secretariat	10:03:50
15	Information Resource Management?	10:03:53
16	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:03:58
17	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:04:01
18	Amendment rights.	10:04:05
19	Q Okay. And prior to becoming director, you	10:04:05
20	were deputy director. Correct?	10:04:08
21	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:04:15
22	to answer that question and invoke my Fifth	10:04:19

	10	
1	Amendment rights.	10:04:24
2	Q The Executive Secretariat Information	10:04:24
3	Resource Management is common commonly referred	10:04:26
4	to as S/ES-IRM. Correct?	10:04:28
5	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:04:35
6	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:04:38
7	Amendment rights.	10:04:43
8	Q What is the role of S/ES-IRM at the State	10:04:43
9	Department?	10:04:47
10	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:04:48
11	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:04:50
12	Amendment rights.	10:04:54
13	Q How many staff reported to you?	10:04:54
14	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:04:58
15	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:05:01
16	Amendment rights.	10:05:04
17	Q And who did you report to?	10:05:04
18	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:05:09
19	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:05:12
20	Amendment rights.	10:05:15
21	Q Is it fair to say that your most important	10:05:15
22	client was the Secretary of State?	10:05:18

		11	
1	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:05:21
2	to answer	that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:05:24
3	Amendment	rights.	10:05:27
4	Q	From S/ES-IRM's perspective, when did	10:05:27
5	Secretary	Clinton's transition begin?	10:05:33
6	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:05:35
7	to answer	that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:05:37
8	Amendment	rights.	10:05:41
9	Q	And what was your involvement in the	10:05:41
10	transitio	n?	10:05:44
11	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:05:45
12	to answer	that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:05:47
13	Amendment	rights.	10:05:51
14	Q	And what was S/ES-IRM's involvement in the	10:05:51
15	transitio	n?	10:05:55
16	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:05:57
17	to answer	that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:05:59
18	Amendment	rights.	10:06:02
19	Q	While you were director, were employees	10:06:02
20	required t	to request an e-mail address when they	10:06:06
21	began the	ir employment at the State Department?	10:06:09
22	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:06:12

	12	
1	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:06:14
2	Amendment rights.	10:06:19
3	Q Of whom specifically did employees request	10:06:20
4	e-mail addresses from?	10:06:23
5	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:06:25
6	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:06:27
7	Amendment rights.	10:06:30
8	Q Either during her trans during her	10:06:30
9	transition, did Mrs. Clinton or any of her staff or	10:06:35
10	representatives request an e-mail address from the	10:06:38
11	State Department?	10:06:40
12	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:06:42
13	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:06:45
14	Amendment rights.	10:06:48
15	Q Did you or any of your staff ask Secretary	10:06:48
16	Clinton or any of her staff or representatives	10:06:53
17	whether she wanted an e-mail address?	10:06:55
18	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:06:59
19	Compound.	10:07:00
20	Q You may answer the question.	10:07:01
21	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:07:04
22	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:07:06

	13	
1	Amendment rights.	10:07:11
2	Q During this period did you or your staff	10:07:11
3	ask Secretary Clinton or any of her staff or	10:07:13
4	representatives whether she was planning to use	10:07:16
5	e-mail to conduct official government business?	10:07:19
6	MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague and	10:07:22
7	compound.	10:07:23
8	Q You may answer the question.	10:07:24
9	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:07:26
10	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:07:28
11	Amendment rights.	10:07:34
12	Q During this period did you or your staff	10:07:34
13	ask Secretary Clinton or any of her staff or	10:07:36
14	representatives whether she was planning to use	10:07:38
15	e-mail to communicate with State Department	10:07:42
16	employees?	10:07:43
17	MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague and	10:07:44
18	compound.	10:07:46
19	Q You may answer the question.	10:07:47
20	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:07:48
21	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:07:51
22	Amendment rights.	10:07:55

	14	
1	Q At any point during Mrs. Clinton's tenure,	10:07:55
2	did you speak to anyone at the State Department	10:08:00
3	about Secretary Clinton's use of e-mail?	10:08:03
4	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:08:06
5	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:08:08
6	Amendment rights.	10:08:12
7	Q Do you know Lee Purcell?	10:08:12
8	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:08:17
9	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:08:19
10	Amendment rights.	10:08:22
11	Q Do you recall receiving a memo from	10:08:22
12	Mr. Purcell entitled, Secretary Residential	10:08:26
13	Installation Hot Wash?	10:08:29
14	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:08:31
15	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:08:34
16	Amendment rights.	10:08:37
17	Q This memorandum refers to a server located	10:08:38
18	in the basement telephone closet. Do you know what	10:08:41
19	this is in reference to?	10:08:44
20	MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague.	10:08:46
21	Q You may answer the question.	10:08:48
22	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:08:50

		15	
1	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:08:52
2	Amendment	rights.	10:08:54
3	Q	Did you at any point know what the	10:08:55
4	reference	to "server located in the basement	10:09:01
5	telephone	closet" was?	10:09:04
6	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:09:07
7	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:09:09
8	Amendment	rights.	10:09:12
9	Q	Did you speak to Mr. Purcell or anyone	10:09:13
10	else abou	t this memo?	10:09:16
11	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:09:18
12	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:09:20
13	Amendment	rights.	10:09:23
14	Q	Did you speak did you ask anyone at the	10:09:23
15	State Dep	artment about the server?	10:09:27
16	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:09:30
17	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:09:32
18	Amendment	rights.	10:09:36
19	Q	Was Secretary Clinton ever assigned an	10:09:36
20	e-mail add	dress?	10:09:40
21	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:09:42
22	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:09:44

	16	
1	Amendment rights.	10:09:48
2	Q Was Secretary Clinton using e-mail to	10:09:48
3	conduct official government business?	10:09:52
4	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:09:54
5	Q You may answer the question.	10:09:56
6	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:09:58
7	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:10:02
8	Amendment rights.	10:10:05
9	Q Was Secretary Clinton using e-mail to	10:10:05
10	communicate with State Department employees?	10:10:09
11	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:10:12
12	Q You may answer the question.	10:10:13
13	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:10:16
14	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:10:18
15	Amendment rights.	10:10:21
16	Q At any point during Secretary Clinton's	10:10:22
17	tenure, did you ask anyone whether Secretary Clinton	10:10:26
18	was using e-mail to conduct official government	10:10:28
19	business?	10:10:31
20	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:10:32
21	to answer that question and I invoke my Fifth	10:10:34
22	Amendment rights.	10:10:38

	17	
1	Q At any point in Mrs in Secretary	10:10:39
2	Clinton's tenure, did you ask anyone whether	10:10:42
3	Secretary Clinton was using a BlackBerry to conduct	10:10:44
4	official government business?	10:10:47
5	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:10:49
6	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:10:52
7	Amendment rights.	10:10:55
8	Q At any point in Secretary Clinton's	10:10:55
9	tenure, did you discuss with anyone at the State	10:10:58
10	Department whether Secretary Clinton was using	10:11:00
11	e-mail to conduct official government business?	10:11:02
12	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:11:05
13	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:11:08
14	Amendment rights.	10:11:10
15	Q At any point in Secretary Clinton's	10:11:11
16	tenure, did you discuss with anyone at the State	10:11:14
17	Department whether Secretary Clinton was using a	10:11:17
18	BlackBerry to conduct official government business?	10:11:18
19	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:11:21
20	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:11:24
21	Amendment rights.	10:11:27
22	Q Do you know Christopher Butzgy?	10:11:28

	18	
1	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:11:32
2	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:11:34
3	Amendment rights.	10:11:37
4	Q Did Mr. Butzgy report to you?	10:11:37
5	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:11:42
6	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:11:44
7	Amendment rights.	10:11:47
8	Q Did Mr. Butzgy ever discuss Secretary	10:11:47
9	Clinton's use of e-mail with you?	10:11:52
10	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:11:54
11	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:11:57
12	Amendment rights.	10:12:01
13	Q Did Mr. Butzgy on or about February 27,	10:12:01
14	2010, discuss with you a service request he received	10:12:06
15	related to Secretary Clinton's e-mail?	10:12:10
16	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:12:13
17	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:12:15
18	Amendment rights.	10:12:18
19	Q Did Mr. Butzgy on or about February 27,	10:12:19
20	2010, discuss with you a service request he received	10:12:23
21	related to the e-mail address	10:12:27
22	HDR22@Clintonemail.com?	10:12:33

	19	
1	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:12:33
2	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:12:36
3	Amendment rights.	10:12:39
4	Q Did you discuss with anyone at the State	10:12:39
5	Department a service request Mr. Butzgy received	10:12:42
6	related to Secretary Clinton's use of e-mail?	10:12:45
7	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:12:49
8	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:12:53
9	Amendment rights.	10:12:55
10	Q Did you discuss with anyone at the State	10:12:55
11	Department a service request Mr. Butzgy received	10:12:59
12	related to the e-mail address	10:13:03
13	HDR22@Clintonemail.com?	10:13:07
14	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:13:07
15	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:13:10
16	Amendment rights.	10:13:13
17	Q Do you know who Cindy Almodovar is?	10:13:14
18	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:13:20
19	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:13:22
20	Amendment rights.	10:13:25
21	Q Did Ms. Almodovar report to you?	10:13:26
22	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:13:30

	20	
1	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:13:32
2	Amendment rights.	10:13:36
3	Q On or about December 17th, 2010, did you	10:13:36
4	receive an e-mail from Ms. Almodovar concerning	10:13:48
5	Secretary Clinton's e-mail difficulties?	10:13:51
6	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:13:54
7	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:13:57
8	Amendment rights.	10:14:00
9	Q Are you part of the SES-IRM_tech list	10:14:00
10	serve?	10:14:11
11	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:14:12
12	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:14:15
13	Amendment rights.	10:14:19
14	Q Were you part of the SES-IRM_FO-MGT list	10:14:19
15	serve or e-mail group?	10:14:27
16	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:14:29
17	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:14:31
18	Amendment rights.	10:14:35
19	Q In an e-mail dated December 17, 2010,	10:14:35
20	Ms. Almodovar stated, "I have a contact with the at	10:14:43
21	Clinton e-mail site. His name is Bryan Pagliano and	10:14:47
22	he actually now works for State, but he apparently	10:14:51

	21	
1	set all of this up."	10:14:54
2	Did you ever discuss this e-mail with	10:14:56
3	Ms. Almodovar?	10:14:59
4	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:15:02
5	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:15:05
6	Amendment rights.	10:15:08
7	Q Did you discuss this e-mail with anyone at	10:15:08
8	the State Department?	10:15:11
9	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:15:13
10	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:15:16
11	Amendment rights.	10:15:19
12	Q What did you think when you read this	10:15:19
13	e-mail?	10:15:21
14	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:15:22
15	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:15:25
16	Amendment rights.	10:15:29
17	Q Did you discuss with anyone at the State	10:15:29
18	Department in December 2010 changing anti-phishing	10:15:32
19	filters to enable the State Department e-mail to be	10:15:36
20	sent to or received by Clintonemail.com?	10:15:39
21	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:15:42
22	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:15:46

	22	
1	Amendment rights.	10:15:49
2	Q In August 2011 did Secretary Clinton	10:15:49
3	decide to use a State Department BlackBerry and	10:15:53
4	e-mail account to e-mail with State Department	10:15:56
5	employees?	10:15:58
6	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:15:59
7	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:16:02
8	Amendment rights.	10:16:05
9	Q In response to an e-mail from Monica	10:16:05
10	Hanley on August 30th, 2011, you wrote, "We actually	10:16:09
11	have an account previously set up, SSHRC@State.gov.	10:16:13
12	There are some old e-mails, but none since January	10:16:19
13	2011. We could get rid of them."	10:16:22
14	What was the e-mail address	10:16:25
15	SSHRC@State.gov that you reference in that e-mail?	10:16:28
16	MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague.	10:16:32
17	Q You may answer the question.	10:16:33
18	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:16:35
19	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:16:38
20	Amendment rights.	10:16:42
21	Q When was the SSHRC@State.gov e-mail	10:16:43
22	account created?	10:16:48

		23	
1	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:16:48
2	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:16:51
3	Amendment	rights.	10:16:54
4	Q	Why was that e-mail address created?	10:16:54
5	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:16:58
6	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:17:01
7	Amendment	rights.	10:17:04
8	Q	Was that e-mail account ever used?	10:17:04
9	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:17:07
10	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:17:11
11	Amendment	rights.	10:17:14
12	Q	What were those old e-mails in that e-mail	10:17:14
13	account?		10:17:17
14	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:17:19
15	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:17:22
16	Amendment	rights.	10:17:25
17	Q	In that August 30th, 2011, e-mail, you	10:17:25
18	also wrote	e, "You should be aware that any e-mail	10:17:29
19	would go t	through the department's infrastructure and	10:17:32
20	subject to	FOIA searches."	10:17:35
21		What did you mean by that?	10:17:37
22	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:17:38

	24	
1	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:17:41
2	Amendment rights.	10:17:44
3	Q Why did you inform Ms. Hanley that the	10:17:44
4	e-mail would be subject to FOIA?	10:17:47
5	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:17:50
6	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:17:53
7	Amendment rights.	10:17:56
8	Q Why did you think that Ms. Hanley needed	10:17:56
9	to be made aware of that?	10:17:59
10	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:18:02
11	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:18:05
12	Amendment rights.	10:18:08
13	Q You concluded that August 30th, 2011,	10:18:08
14	e-mail with, "Let me know if any questions and what	10:18:13
15	you would like us to do."	10:18:17
16	What did you mean by that?	10:18:19
17	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:18:20
18	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:18:23
19	Amendment rights.	10:18:26
20	Q Did you have any followup conversations	10:18:26
21	with Ms. Hanley?	10:18:29
22	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:18:31

		٦٢	ı
1	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:18:35
2	Amendment	rights.	10:18:37
3	Q	Did you discuss this issue with anyone at	10:18:37
4	the State	Department?	10:18:41
5		MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague.	10:18:42
6	Q	You may answer the question.	10:18:43
7	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:18:46
8	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:18:48
9	Amendment	rights.	10:18:52
10	Q	Were any action items taken after this	10:18:52
11	e-mail com	nversation?	10:18:57
12		MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague.	10:18:59
13	Q	You may answer the question.	10:19:00
14	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:19:02
15	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:19:06
16	Amendment	rights.	10:19:08
17	Q	As S/ES-IRM director, what were your	10:19:08
18	responsib	ilities with respect to the Freedom of	10:19:13
19	Informatio	on Act?	10:19:16
20	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:19:17
21	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:19:19
22	Amendment	rights.	10:19:22

	26	
1	Q What were the responsibilities of your	10:19:23
2	office with respect to the Freedom of Information	10:19:26
3	Act?	10:19:28
4	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:19:29
5	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:19:32
6	Amendment rights.	10:19:35
7	Q Were you ever asked to help facilitate the	10:19:35
8	search of Secretary Clinton's e-mails in response to	10:19:38
9	a FOIA request?	10:19:41
10	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:19:43
11	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:19:45
12	Amendment rights.	10:19:48
13	Q Did the State Department receive FOIA	10:19:48
14	requests for Secretary Clinton's e-mail?	10:19:52
15	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:19:54
16	Q You may answer the question.	10:19:56
17	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:19:58
18	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:20:01
19	Amendment rights.	10:20:03
20	Q Do you know Clarence Finney?	10:20:03
21	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:20:07
22	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:20:09

	27	
1	Amendment rights.	10:20:13
2	Q Did you ever speak to Mr. Finney about	10:20:13
3	Mrs. Clinton's use of e-mail to conduct official	10:20:17
4	government business?	10:20:21
5	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:20:22
6	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:20:25
7	Amendment rights.	10:20:30
8	Q Did you ever speak to Mr. Finney about	10:20:31
9	Mrs. Clinton about Secretary Clinton's use of a	10:20:35
10	BlackBerry to conduct official government business?	10:20:38
11	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:20:41
12	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:20:44
13	Amendment rights.	10:20:46
14	Q Did Mr. Finney ever ask you whether	10:20:47
15	Secretary Clinton had or was using a State	10:20:51
16	Department e-mail account?	10:20:54
17	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:20:56
18	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:20:59
19	Amendment rights.	10:21:02
20	Q Did Mr. Finney ever ask you whether	10:21:02
21	Secretary Clinton had or was using a State	10:21:05
22	Department BlackBerry?	10:21:08

	28	
1	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:21:09
2	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:21:12
3	Amendment rights.	10:21:15
4	Q Did Mr. Finney ever ask any of your staff	10:21:15
5	whether Secretary Clinton had or was using a State	10:21:20
6	Department e-mail account?	10:21:23
7	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:21:25
8	Q You may answer the question.	10:21:26
9	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:21:28
10	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:21:31
11	Amendment rights.	10:21:34
12	Q Did Mr. Finney ever ask any of your staff	10:21:35
13	whether Secretary Clinton had or was using a State	10:21:38
14	Department BlackBerry?	10:21:42
15	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:21:43
16	Q You may answer the question.	10:21:44
17	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:21:46
18	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:21:49
19	Amendment rights.	10:21:52
20	Q Do you know Bryan Pagliano?	10:21:52
21	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:21:56
22	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:21:59

	29	
1	Amendment rights.	10:22:02
2	Q How do you know Mr. Pagliano?	10:22:02
3	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:22:06
4	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:22:08
5	Amendment rights.	10:22:11
6	Q Did you ever speak with Mr. Pagliano about	10:22:11
7	Secretarys Clinton Secretary Clinton's use of	10:22:22
8	e-mail?	10:22:25
9	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:22:26
10	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:22:29
11	Amendment rights.	10:22:33
12	Q In late 2010 did two S/ES-IRM staff	10:22:33
13	discuss with you concerns about Secretary Clinton's	10:22:40
14	use of a personal e-mail account?	10:22:42
15	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:22:44
16	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:22:47
17	Amendment rights.	10:22:50
18	Q Did a staff member raise concerns that	10:22:50
19	information sent and received on Secretary Clinton's	10:22:54
20	account could contain federal records that needed to	10:22:57
21	be preserved in order to satisfy federal	10:23:00
22	record-keeping requirements?	10:23:03

	30	
1	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:23:05
2	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:23:07
3	Amendment rights.	10:23:10
4	Q At any time did you tell a staff member	10:23:11
5	that Secretary Clinton's personal system had been	10:23:14
6	reviewed and approved by State Department legal	10:23:17
7	staff and that the matter should not be discussed	10:23:19
8	any further?	10:23:22
9	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:23:23
10	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:23:26
11	Amendment rights.	10:23:29
12	Q Was Secretary Clinton's e-mail usage	10:23:29
13	approved by the State Department's legal staff?	10:23:34
14	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:23:38
15	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:23:42
16	Amendment rights.	10:23:46
17	Q At any time did you tell a staff member	10:23:46
18	that the mission of S/ES-IRM is to support the	10:23:50
19	Secretary and instruct the staff member never to	10:23:54
20	speak of the Secretary's personal e-mail system	10:23:56
21	again?	10:23:59
22	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:24:00

		1
	31	
1	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:24:03
2	Amendment rights.	10:24:06
3	Q Why did you tell the staff member never to	10:24:06
4	speak of the e-mail system again?	10:24:09
5	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:24:12
6	Q You may answer the question.	10:24:13
7	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:24:14
8	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:24:17
9	Amendment rights.	10:24:20
10	Q According to the FBI, you stated that you	10:24:20
11	knew that Secretary Clinton had a personal e-mail	10:24:23
12	account but that you did not know she was using it	10:24:26
13	for work-related matters.	10:24:29
14	How do you know she had a personal e-mail	10:24:30
15	account?	10:24:32
16	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:24:34
17	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:24:36
18	Amendment rights.	10:24:39
19	Q When did you learn that Secretary Clinton	10:24:40
20	had a personal e-mail account?	10:24:43
21	MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:24:45
22	Q You may answer the question.	10:24:47

		32	
1	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:24:48
2	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:24:53
3	Amendment	rights.	10:24:56
4	Q	What were you told about Secretary	10:24:56
5	Clinton's	personal e-mail account?	10:25:00
6		MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague.	10:25:05
7	Q	You may answer the question.	10:25:07
8	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:25:08
9	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:25:10
10	Amendment	rights.	10:25:13
11	Q	Why did you think Secretary Clinton was	10:25:13
12	not using	her e-mail account for work-related	10:25:16
13	matters?		10:25:20
14		MR. MYERS: Objection. Foundation.	10:25:21
15	Q	You may answer the question.	10:25:22
16	A	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:25:24
17	to answer	the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:25:26
18	Amendment	rights.	10:25:29
19	Q	Did you know that Secretary Clinton was	10:25:29
20	e-mailing	State Department employees from her e-mail	10:25:32
21	address?		10:25:35
22	А	On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:25:36

	33	
1	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:25:39
2	Amendment rights.	10:25:43
3	Q As the director of the IT services for the	10:25:43
4	principals of the State Department, were you not	10:25:48
5	consulted in any way regarding her use of a personal	10:25:51
6	e-mail account for official business?	10:25:54
7	MR. MYERS: Objection. Vague.	10:25:56
8	Q You may answer the question.	10:25:58
9	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:26:00
10	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:26:03
11	Amendment rights.	10:26:05
12	Q Do you have any knowledge of anyone at the	10:26:06
13	State Department who was aware that she exclusively	10:26:09
14	was using a personal e-mail account during her	10:26:13
15	tenure?	10:26:16
16	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:26:17
17	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:26:20
18	Amendment rights.	10:26:24
19	Q Did you ever communicate with Secretary	10:26:24
20	Clinton via e-mail?	10:26:27
21	A On advice from my legal counsel, I decline	10:26:29
22	to answer the question and I invoke my Fifth	10:26:32

	34	
1	Amendment rights.	10:26:35
2	Q Why did you retire?	10:26:35
3	MR. MYERS: Objection. Beyond the scope	10:26:39
4	of authorized discovery.	10:26:42
5	Q You may answer.	10:26:43
6	MR. LYNN: I'll second the objection and	10:26:43
7	instruct the witness not to answer.	10:26:46
8	A I'll follow the advice.	10:26:47
9	Q Are you currently employed?	10:26:48
10	MR. MYERS: Objection. Beyond the scope	10:26:50
11	of authorized discovery.	10:26:51
12	MR. LYNN: I'll second the objection and	10:26:52
13	instruct the witness not to answer.	10:26:54
14	Q Has Secretary Clinton or anyone associated	10:26:56
15	with her offered you any future employment?	10:26:59
16	MR. MYERS: Objection. Beyond the scope	10:27:02
17	of authorized discovery.	10:27:03
18	MR. LYNN: I'll second the objection and	10:27:04
19	instruct the witness not to answer.	10:27:06
20	Q Is Secretary Clinton or anyone or entity	10:27:08
21	associated with her paying your legal bills related	10:27:10
22	to this matter or any other matters concerning her	10:27:14

	35	
1	e-mail usage at the State Department?	10:27:17
2	MR. MYERS: Objection. Beyond the scope	10:27:19
3	of authorized discovery.	10:27:21
4	MR. LYNN: Seconded, and I instruct the	10:27:22
5	witness not to answer.	10:27:23
6	Q Has Secretary Clinton or anyone or entity	10:27:25
7	associated with her provided you with any financial	10:27:28
8	incentives related to this matter or any other	10:27:30
9	matters concerning her e-mail usage at the State	10:27:33
10	Department?	10:27:36
11	MR. MYERS: Objection. Beyond the scope	10:27:37
12	of authorized discovery.	10:27:38
13	MR. LYNN: Seconded, and I'll instruct the	10:27:39
14	witness not to answer.	10:27:41
15	Q When was the last time you spoke with	10:27:42
16	Secretary Clinton?	10:27:44
17	MR. MYERS: Objection as to scope.	10:27:45
18	MR. LYNN: Seconded. I'll instruct the	10:27:46
19	witness not to answer.	10:27:48
20	Q When was the last time you spoke with	10:27:49
21	Ms. Abedin?	10:27:51
22	MR. MYERS: Same objection.	10:27:52

		1
	36	
1	MR. LYNN: Seconded. I'll instruct the	10:27:53
2	witness not to answer.	10:27:54
3	Q When was the last time you spoke with	10:27:56
4	Ms. Mills?	10:27:58
5	MR. MYERS: Same objection.	10:27:59
6	MR. LYNN: I'll second the objection and	10:28:00
7	instruct the witness not to answer.	10:28:02
8	MR. BEKESHA: Why don't we take about a	10:28:07
9	five-minute break.	10:28:08
10	VIDEO SPECIALIST: We are going off the	10:28:09
11	record. The time is 10:28.	10:28:10
12	(A recess was taken.)	10:28:12
13	VIDEO SPECIALIST: We are back on the	10:32:55
14	record. The time is 10:33.	10:33:03
15	MR. BEKESHA: I have no more questions.	10:33:07
16	MR. LYNN: No questions from this side.	10:33:10
17	VIDEO SPECIALIST: This marks the end of	10:33:11
18	the deposition of John A. Bentel. We are going off	10:33:13
19	the record at 10:33.	10:33:16
20	(Off the record at 10:33 a.m.)	
21		
22		

37 1 CERTIFICATE OF SHORTHAND REPORTER - NOTARY PUBLIC I, Debra Ann Whitehead, the officer before whom 2 3 the foregoing deposition was taken, do hereby certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and 4 5 correct record of the testimony given; that said testimony was taken by me stenographically and 6 7 thereafter reduced to typewriting under my 8 direction; that reading and signing was not 9 requested; and that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to 10 11 this case and have no interest, financial or 12 otherwise, in its outcome. 13 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and 14 affixed my notarial seal this 24th day of October, 15 2016. 16 17 My commission expires: 18 September 14, 2018 19 Delin a les Litted 20 NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR THE 21 22 DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

	1		1	
A	37:14	23:6,10,15 24:1,6,11	2:6 3:17 4:15 6:12	
Abedin	after	24:18 25:1,6,8,13,15	aware	
8:8 35:21	25:10	25:21 26:5,11,16,18	23:18 24:9 33:13	
about	again	26:22 27:6,12,18 28:2	A-R-T-H-U-R	
8:3,17 14:3 15:10,15	30:21 31:4	28:8,10,16,18,22 29:4	8:13	
18:13,19 20:3 27:2,8	against	29:10,16 30:2,10,15	a.m	
27:9 29:6,13 32:4	8:4	31:1,6,8,17,22 32:2,7	1:14 36:20	
36:8	Alison	32:9,15,17 33:1,8,10	В	
According	4:3 7:10	33:17,22 34:5,7,13,19	B	
31:10	all	35:5,14,19 36:2,7		
account	21:1	anti-phishing	5:5	
22:4,11,22 23:8,13	Almodovar	21:18	back	
27:16 28:6 29:14,20	19:17,21 20:4,20 21:3	any	36:13	
31:12,15,20 32:5,12	already	9:10 12:9,15,16 13:3	Baker	
33:6,14	8:17	13:13 14:1 15:3	2:4 4:13 7:1,3	
Act	also	16:16 17:1,8,15 23:18	basement	
8:4 25:19 26:3	4:20 8:15,22 9:3 23:18	24:14,20 25:10 28:4	14:18 15:4	
action	Amendment	28:12 30:4,8,17 33:5	because	
1:6 6:6 25:10	9:18 10:1,7,12,16,20	33:12 34:15,22 35:7,8	9:5	
actually	11:3,8,13,18 12:2,7	37:10	become	
20:22 22:10	12:14 13:1,11,22 14:6	anyone	9:14	
address	14:10,16 15:2,8,13,18	14:2 15:9,14 16:17	becoming	
11:20 12:10,17 15:20	16:1,8,15,22 17:7,14	17:2,9,16 19:4,10	9:19	
18:21 19:12 22:14	17:21 18:3,7,12,18	21:7,17 25:3 33:12	been 7:18 30:5	
23:4 32:21	19:3,9,16,20 20:2,8	34:14,20 35:6	before	
addresses	20:13,18 21:6,11,16	apparently		
12:4	22:1,8,20 23:3,7,11	20:22	2:11 8:10,15 37:2	
advice	23:16 24:2,7,12,19	approved	began 11:21	
9:16,21 10:5,10,14,18	25:2,9,16,22 26:6,12	2:12 30:6,13		
11:1,6,11,16,22 12:5	26:19 27:1,7,13,19	Arthur	begin	
12:12,21 13:9,20 14:4	28:3,11,19 29:1,5,11	1:11 2:1 5:2 7:17 8:12	8:10,15 11:5	
14:8,14,22 15:6,11,16	29:17 30:3,11,16 31:2	8:13	begins 6:2	
15:21 16:6,13,20 17:5	31:9,18 32:3,10,18	asked	behalf	
17:12,19 18:1,5,10,16		26:7		
19:1,7,14,18,22 20:6	Ann	asking	3:2,12 4:2,10 6:15 7:2 7:3	
20:11,16 21:4,9,14,21	37:2	9:8	Bekesha	
22:6,18 23:1,5,9,14	answer	assigned	3:3 5:3 6:15,15 7:20	
23:22 24:5,10,17,22	9:17,22 10:6,11,15,19	15:19	8:1 36:8,15	
25:7,14,20 26:4,10,17	11:2,7,12,17 12:1,6	associated	Bentel	
26:21 27:5,11,17 28:1	12:13,20,22 13:8,10	34:14,21 35:7		
28:9,17,21 29:3,9,15	13:19,21 14:5,9,15,21	attorney	1:11 2:1 5:2 6:3 7:2,6 7:17,21 8:12,13 36:18	
30:1,9,14,22 31:7,16	15:1,7,12,17,22 16:5	8:2 9:9	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
32:1,8,16,22 33:9,16	16:7,12,14,21 17:6,13	August Berman 3:14 7:8,8		
33:21 34:8	17:20 18:2,6,11,17	22:2,10 23:17 24:13	Beyond	
ADVISOR	19:2,8,15,19 20:1,7	authorized	· ·	
4:5	20:12,17 21:5,10,15	34:4,11,17 35:3,12 34:3,10,16 35:2,11 bills		
affixed	21:22 22:7,17,19 23:2	Avenue	34:21	
			<i>J</i> T.⊿1	

	I		I	
bit	9:2	29:20	6:12	
8:19	client	conversation	Debbie	
BlackBerry	10:22	25:11	7:13	
17:3,18 22:3 27:10,22	Clinton	conversations	Debra	
28:14	8:6,7 12:9,16 13:3,13	24:20	1:22 2:11 37:2	
Botts	15:19 16:2,9,17 17:3	correct	December	
2:4 4:13 7:1,4	17:10,17 20:21 22:2	9:20 10:4 37:5	20:3,19 21:18	
break	27:9,15,21 28:5,13	could	decide	
36:9	29:7 31:11,19 32:11	8:10 22:13 29:20	22:3	
Bryan	32:19 33:20 34:14,20	counsel	decline	
20:21 28:20	35:6,16	6:13 7:19 8:17 9:9,16	9:16,21 10:5,10,14,18	
business	Clintonemail.com	9:21 10:5,10,14,18	11:1,6,11,16,22 12:5	
8:9 13:5 16:3,19 17:4	21:20	11:1,6,11,16,22 12:5	12:12,21 13:9,20 14:4	
17:11,18 27:4,10 33:6		12:12,21 13:9,20 14:4	14:8,14,22 15:6,11,16	
Butzgy	11:5 14:1,3 16:16 17:2	14:8,14,22 15:6,11,16	15:21 16:6,13,20 17:5	
17:22 18:4,8,13,19	17:8,15 18:9,15 19:6	15:21 16:6,13,20 17:5	17:12,19 18:1,5,10,16	
19:5,11	20:5 26:8,14 27:3,9	17:12,19 18:1,5,10,16	19:1,7,14,18,22 20:6	
B-E-N-T-E-L	29:7,13,19 30:5,12	19:1,7,14,18,22 20:6	20:11,16 21:4,9,14,21	
8:14	32:5	20:11,16 21:4,9,14,21	22:6,18 23:1,5,9,14	
$\overline{\mathbf{C}}$	closet	22:6,18 23:1,5,9,14	23:22 24:5,10,17,22	
$\frac{c}{c}$	14:18 15:5	23:22 24:5,10,17,22	25:7,14,20 26:4,10,17	
3:1 4:1,1,6 5:1 6:1	Columbia	25:7,14,20 26:4,10,17	26:21 27:5,11,17 28:1	
cannot	1:2 2:13 6:6 37:22	26:21 27:5,11,17 28:1	28:9,17,21 29:3,9,15	
9:5	commission 37:17	28:9,17,21 29:3,9,15	30:1,9,14,22 31:7,16	
can't	common	30:1,9,14,22 31:7,16	32:1,8,16,22 33:9,16 33:21	
9:11	10:3	32:1,8,16,22 33:9,16 33:21 37:9	Defendant	
capacity	commonly	court	1:8 3:12 4:2	
7:7	10:3	1:1 2:12 6:6 7:12 9:5	Department	
case	communicate	9:11	1:7 3:15 4:4 6:5 7:6,9	
37:11	13:15 16:10 33:19	created	7:11 8:5 10:9 11:21	
CERTIFICATE	compound	22:22 23:4	12:11 13:15 14:2	
37:1	12:19 13:7,18	creation	15:15 16:10 17:10,17	
certify	concerning	8:6	19:5,11 21:8,18,19	
37:4	20:4 34:22 35:9	currently	22:3,4 25:4 26:13	
changing	concerns	34:9	27:16,22 28:6,14 30:6	
21:18	29:13,18		32:20 33:4,13 35:1,10	
Christopher	concluded	D	department's	
17:22	24:13	D	9:9 23:19 30:13	
Cindy	conduct	4:1 6:1	deponent	
19:17	8:8 13:5 16:3,18 17:3	date	7:2	
Civil	17:11,18 27:3,10	6:8	Depos	
1:6 3:16 6:6	consulted	dated	6:11 7:14	
Clarence	33:5	20:19	deposition	
26:20	contact	day	1:11 2:1 6:3,11 8:18	
Clark	20:20	37:14 DC	36:18 37:3	
4:12 7:3,3	contain	DC	deputy	
clearer		1:12 2:7 3:9,18 4:7,16		

9:20	employment	8:6	23:20 24:4 26:9,13	
Derek	11:21 34:15		follow	
4:21 6:10	enable	F	34:8	
difficulties	21:19	F	follows	
20:5	end	3:4	7:18	
direction	36:17	facilitate	followup	
37:8	entitled	26:7	24:20	
director	14:12	fair	foregoing	
9:14,19,20 11:19 25:17	entity	10:21	37:3,4	
33:3	34:20 35:6	FBI	former	
discovery	ESQUIRE	31:10	7:7	
34:4,11,17 35:3,12	3:3,4,5,13,14 4:3,11,12	February	Foundation	
discuss	even	18:13,19	12:18 16:4,11 26:15	
17:9,16 18:8,14,20	9:4	federal	28:7,15 31:5,21 32:14	
19:4,10 21:2,7,17	ever	29:20,21	Fox	
25:3 29:13	15:19 18:8 21:2 23:8	few	4:21 6:10	
discussed	26:7 27:2,8,14,20	8:16	Freedom	
30:7	28:4,12 29:6 33:19	Fifth	8:3 25:18 26:2	
District	everybody	9:17,22 10:6,11,15,19	full	
1:1,2 2:12,13 6:5,6	9:12	11:2,7,12,17 12:1,6	8:11,12	
37:22	EXAMINATION	12:13,22 13:10,21	further	
DIVISION	5:2 7:19	14:5,9,15 15:1,7,12	30:8	
3:16	exclusively	15:17,22 16:7,14,21	future	
done	33:13	17:6,13,20 18:2,6,11	34:15	
9:8,10	Executive	18:17 19:2,8,15,19	G	
down	9:14 10:2	20:1,7,12,17 21:5,10	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
9:12	expires	21:15,22 22:7,19 23:2		
duly	37:17	23:6,10,15 24:1,6,11	6:1	
7:18	e-mail	24:18 25:1,8,15,21 26:5,11,18,22 27:6,12	gestures 9:5	
during	11:20 12:4,10,17 13:5	27:18 28:2,10,18,22	given	
12:8,8 13:2,12 14:1	13:15 14:3 15:20	29:4,10,16 30:2,10,15		
16:16 33:14	16:2,9,18 17:11 18:9	31:1,8,17 32:2,9,17		
	18:15,21 19:6,12 20:4	33:1,10,17,22	go 8:16,18 23:19	
E	20:5,15,19,21 21:2,7	53.1,10,17,22 filters	going	
3:1,1 4:1,1,1 5:1,5 6:1	21:13,19 22:4,4,9,14	21:19	36:10,18	
6:1	22:15,21 23:4,8,12,17	Finally	Good	
Either	23:18 24:4,14 25:11	9:7	7:21,22	
12:8	26:14 27:3,16 28:6 29:8,14 30:12,20 31:4	financial	government	
else	31:11,14,20 32:5,12	35:7 37:11	8:8 13:5 16:3,18 17:4	
15:10	32:20 33:6,14,20 35:1	Finney	17:11,18 27:4,10	
employed	35:9	26:20 27:2,8,14,20	ground	
34:9 37:10	e-mailing	28:4,12	8:16	
employee	32:20	Fitton	group	
7:7	e-mails	4:22 6:21,21	20:15	
employees	22:12 23:12 26:8	five-minute		
11:19 12:3 13:16 16:10	e-mail.com	36:9	Н	
22:5 32:20		FOIA	Н	

	I			
5:5	35:13,18 36:1,7	K	14:17 15:4	
hand	interest	knew	loud	
37:13	37:11	31:11	9:4	
Hanley	invoke	know	Lynn	
22:10 24:3,8,21	9:17,22 10:6,11,15,19	8:21 9:1 14:7,18 15:3	4:11 7:1,1 34:6,12,18	
happy	11:2,7,12,17 12:1,6	17:22 19:17 24:14	35:4,13,18 36:1,6,16	
8:21	12:13,22 13:10,21	26:20 28:20 29:2	L.L.P	
HDR22@Clintonem	14:5,9,15 15:1,7,12	31:12,14 32:19	2:4 4:13	
18:22 19:13	15:17,22 16:7,14,21	knowledge		
head	17:6,13,20 18:2,6,11	33:12	M	
9:4	18:17 19:2,8,15,19	Kyle	made	
hear	20:1,7,12,17 21:5,10	4:12 7:3	24:9	
8:20	21:15,22 22:7,19 23:2		make	
held	23:6,10,15 24:1,6,11	L	9:1	
2:1	24:18 25:1,8,15,21	last	makes	
help	26:5,11,18,22 27:6,12	35:15,20 36:3	9:10	
8:18 26:7	27:18 28:2,10,18,22	late	Management	
here	29:4,10,16 30:2,10,15	29:12	9:15 10:3	
6:2 8:2	31:1,8,17 32:2,9,17	lawsuits	many	
hereby	33:1,10,17,22	8:4	10:13	
37:3	involvement	learn	Marcia	
hereunto	11:9,14	31:19	3:14 7:8	
37:13	issue	Lee	marked	
Hillary	25:3	14:7	5:6	
8:7	items	legal	marks	
Hot	25:10	4:5 9:16,21 10:5,10,14	36:17	
14:13		10:18 11:1,6,11,16,22	Massachusetts	
Huma	<u>J</u>	12:5,12,21 13:9,20	3:17	
8:8	J	14:4,8,14,22 15:6,11	matter	
	3:5 4:22	15:16,21 16:6,13,20	6:4 30:7 34:22 35:8	
<u> </u>	James	17:5,12,19 18:1,5,10	matters	
important	3:4 6:19	18:16 19:1,7,14,18,22	31:13 32:13 34:22 35:9	
9:3,7 10:21	Jamie	20:6,11,16 21:4,9,14	mean	
Inc	4:11 7:1	21:21 22:6,18 23:1,5	23:21 24:16	
1:4 3:6 6:4	January	23:9,14,22 24:5,10,17	member	
incentives	22:12	24:22 25:7,14,20 26:4	29:18 30:4,17,19 31:3	
35:8	Job	26:10,17,21 27:5,11	memo	
inform	1:20	27:17 28:1,9,17,21	14:11 15:10	
24:3	John	29:3,9,15 30:1,6,9,13	memorandum	
information	1:11 2:1 5:2 6:3 7:2,17	30:14,22 31:7,16 32:1	14:17	
8:4 9:15 10:2 25:19	8:12 36:18	32:8,16,22 33:9,16,21	Michael	
26:2 29:19	Judicial	34:21	3:3 6:15 8:1	
infrastructure	1:4 3:6 4:22 6:4,16,17	list	might	
23:19	6:19,22 8:2,3	20:9,14	8:17	
Installation	JUSTICE	little	Mills	
14:13	3:15	8:18	36:4	
instruct	J-O-H-N	located	mission	
30:19 34:7,13,19 35:4	8:13		30:18	
<u></u>				

Monday	0	9:3,13	4:20	
1:13	$\frac{1}{0}$	outcome	preserved	
Monica	4:1 5:1 6:1	37:12	29:21	
22:9	objecting	over	President	
monitor	9:11	8:16	4:22 6:21	
6:9	objection		previously	
more	12:18 13:6,17 14:20	P	22:11	
8:19 36:15	16:4,11 22:16 25:5,12	P	principals	
morning	26:15 28:7,15 31:5,21	3:1,1 4:1,1 6:1	33:4	
7:21,22	32:6,14 33:7 34:3,6	PAGE	prior	
most	34:10,12,16,18 35:2	5:2	9:19	
10:21	35:11,17,22 36:5,6	Pages	provided	
Myers	objections	1:21	35:7	
3:13 7:5,5 12:18 13:6	9:10	Pagliano	Public	
13:17 14:20 16:4,11	October	20:21 28:20 29:2,6	2:13 37:1,21	
22:16 25:5,12 26:15	1:13 6:8 37:14	part	Purcell	
28:7,15 31:5,21 32:6	offered	20:9,14	14:7,12 15:9	
32:14 33:7 34:3,10,16	34:15	parties	purpose	
35:2,11,17,22 36:5	office	37:10	8:6	
myself	4:5 26:2	Paul	Pursuant	
9:1	officer	3:5 6:17	2:11	
	37:2	paying		
N	offices	34:21	Q	
N	2:2	Pennsylvania	question	
3:1 4:1,1,1 5:1,1 6:1	official	2:6 4:15 6:12	9:8,17,22 10:6,11,15	
name	7:6 8:8 13:5 16:3,18	period	10:19 11:2,7,12,17	
8:1,11,12 20:21	17:4,11,18 27:3,10	13:2,12	12:1,6,13,20,22 13:8	
needed	33:6	personal	13:10,19,21 14:5,9,15	
24:8 29:20	Okay	29:14 30:5,20 31:11,14	14:21 15:1,7,12,17,22	
neither	9:19	31:20 32:5 33:5,14 16:5,7,12,14,21 1		
37:9	old	perspective	17:13,20 18:2,6,11,17	
never	22:12 23:12	11:4 19:2,8,15,19 20:1		
30:19 31:3	once	Peterson	20:12,17 21:5,10,15	
none	9:12	3:4 6:19,19	21:22 22:7,17,19 23:2	
5:6 22:12	one	place 23:6,10,15 24:1,6		
Northwest	8:3,20,22	6:11	24:18 25:1,6,8,13,15	
6:12	opposed	Plaintiff	25:21 26:5,11,16,18	
notarial	9:4	1:5 3:2 7:19	26:22 27:6,12,18 28:2	
37:14	order	Planet	28:8,10,16,18,22 29:4	
Notary	29:21	6:10 7:13	29:10,16 30:2,10,15	
2:13 37:1,21	Orfanedes	planning	31:1,6,8,17,22 32:2,7	
notice	3:5 6:17,17	13:4,14	32:9,15,17 33:1,8,10	
2:11	other	please 33:17,22		
Number	34:22 35:8	6:13 7:15 8:10,21 9:1	questions	
6:2,7	otherwise	point	8:3,5,20,22 24:14	
NW	37:12	14:1 15:3 16:16 17:1,8	36:15,16	
2:6 3:17 4:6,15	out	17:15	R	
•	1 0 000	PRESENT	ı K	

R	37:1	22:1,8,20 23:3,7,11	34:14,20 35:6,16	
3:1 4:1,3,11 6:1	represent	23:16 24:2,7,12,19	Secretarys	
raise	6:14	25:2,9,16,22 26:6,12	29:7	
29:18	representatives	26:19 27:1,7,13,19	Secretary's	
read	12:10,16 13:4,14	28:3,11,19 29:1,5,11	30:20	
21:12	representing	29:17 30:3,11,16 31:2	sent	
reading	6:10 7:13	31:9,18 32:3,10,18	21:20 29:19	
37:8	request	33:2,11,18 34:1	September	
recall	11:20 12:3,10 18:14,20	role	37:18	
14:11	19:5,11 26:9	10:8	serve	
receive	requested	rules	20:10,15	
20:4 26:13	37:9	8:16,18	server	
received	requests		14:17 15:4,15	
18:14,20 19:5,11 21:20	26:14	S	service	
29:19	required	S	18:14,20 19:5,11	
receiving	11:20	3:1 4:1 5:1,5 6:1	services	
14:11	requirements	said	33:3	
recess	29:22	37:5	SES-IRM_FO-MGT	
36:12	Residential	Same	20:14	
record	14:12	35:22 36:5	SES-IRM_tech	
8:11 9:5 36:11,14,19	Resource	satisfy	20:9	
36:20 37:5	9:15 10:3	29:21	set	
records	respect	say	21:1 22:11 37:13	
29:20	25:18 26:2	10:21	shaking	
record-keeping	respond	scope	9:4	
29:22	9:3	34:3,10,16 35:2,11,17	SHORTHAND	
reduced	response	seal	37:1	
37:7	22:9 26:8	37:14	should	
reference	responses	search	23:18 30:7	
14:19 15:4 22:15	9:12	26:8	side	
referred	responsibilities	searches	36:16	
10:3	25:18 26:1	23:20	signing	
refers	retire	second	37:8	
14:17	34:2	34:6,12,18 36:6	since	
regarding	reviewed	Seconded	22:12	
33:5	30:6	35:4,13,18 36:1	site	
related	rid	Secretariat	20:21	
18:15,21 19:6,12 34:21	22:13	9:14 10:2	smoothly	
35:8 37:10	rights	Secretary	8:19	
repeat	9:18 10:1,7,12,16,20	8:7 10:22 11:5 12:15	some	
8:21	11:3,8,13,18 12:2,7	13:3,13 14:3,12 15:19	8:3 22:12	
report	12:14 13:1,11,22 14:6	16:2,9,16,17 17:1,3,8	sorts	
10:17 18:4 19:21	14:10,16 15:2,8,13,18	17:10,15,17 18:8,15	9:6	
reported	16:1,8,15,22 17:7,14	19:6 20:5 22:2 26:8	speak	
1:22 10:13	17:21 18:3,7,12,18	26:14 27:9,15,21 28:5	14:2 15:9,14 27:2,8	
reporter	19:3,9,16,20 20:2,8	28:13 29:7,13,19 30:5	29:6 30:20 31:4	
2:12 7:12,15 9:5,11	20:13,18 21:6,11,16	30:12,19 31:11,19	speaking	
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		22 4 4 4 4 0 2 2 4 0	1 9	
		32:4,11,19 33:19		

		I	I		
9:8,12	8:5	21:12 24:8 32:11	use		
Specialist	SW	Third 8:6 13:4,14 14:3 13			
4:21 6:2 7:12 36:10,13	3:7	3:7	19:6 22:3 27:3,9 29:7		
36:17	swear	third-party	29:14 33:5		
specifically	7:15	7:2	using		
8:5 12:3	sworn	THOMAS	16:2,9,18 17:3,10,17		
spell	7:18	4:22	27:15,21 28:5,13		
8:11	system	through	31:12 32:12 33:14		
spelled	8:7 30:5,20 31:4	23:19	U.S		
8:13	S/ES-IRM	time	1:7 3:15 6:4		
spoke	10:4,8 25:17 29:12	6:9 30:4,17 35:15,20			
35:15,20 36:3	30:18	36:3,11,14	V		
SSHRC@State.gov	S/ES-IRM's	today	v		
22:11,15,21	11:4,14	6:10 7:13	1:6		
staff		Today's	Vague		
10:13 12:9,15,16 13:2	T	6:8	13:6,17 14:20 22:16		
13:3,12,13 28:4,12	T	told	25:5,12 32:6 33:7		
29:12,18 30:4,7,13,17	4:1 5:1,1,5	32:4	versus		
30:19 31:3	take	Tom	6:4		
state	36:8	6:21	via		
1:7 4:4 6:5,14 7:5,7,8	taken	trans	33:20		
7:11 8:4,7,10 9:9	25:10 36:12 37:3,6	12:8	video		
10:8,22 11:21 12:11	taking	transcript	4:21 6:2,9,11 7:12		
13:15 14:2 15:15	6:11	37:4	36:10,13,17		
16:10 17:9,16 19:4,10	talked	transition	videographer		
20:22 21:8,17,19 22:3	8:17	11:5,10,15 12:9 6:10			
22:4 25:4 26:13	Tape	true videotaped			
27:15,21 28:5,13 30:6	6:2	37:4 1:11 2:1 6:3			
30:13 32:20 33:4,13	telephone	try voice-identify			
35:1,9	14:18 15:5	9:1	6:13		
stated	tell	two			
20:20 31:10	30:4,17 31:3	29:12	W		
States	tenure	typewriting	wait		
1:1 2:12 4:4 6:5	14:1 16:17 17:2,9,16	37:7	9:7,10		
stenographically	33:15		wanted		
37:6	testified	U	12:17		
Steven	7:18	\mathbf{U}	Warner		
3:13 7:5	testimony	4:1	2:5 4:14		
Street	37:5,6	under	Wash		
3:7 4:6	Thank	37:7	14:13		
subject	8:15	understand	Washington		
23:20 24:4	themselves	8:22 1:12 2:7 3:9,18 4:7			
Suite	6:14	United	6:12		
3:8	thereafter	1:1 2:12 4:4 6:5 Watch			
support	37:7	until	1:4 3:6 4:22 6:4,16,18		
30:18	things	9:8,10	6:20,22 8:2		
surrounding	9:6	usage	Watch's		
	think	30:12 35:1,9	8:3		
Ī	1	Ĭ	1		

				40
way	17th		6	
9:13 33:5	20:3	<u> </u>	0	
Welcher	20.3	639-7700		
4:3 7:10,10	2	2:8 4:17		
WHEREOF	20	646-5172		
37:13	3:17	3:10		
whether	20004-2400	647-6371		
12:17 13:4,14 16:17	2:7 4:16	4:8		
17:2,10,17 27:14,20	20024		7	
28:5,13	3:9	7		
Whitehead	2010	5:3		
1:22 2:11 7:13 37:2	18:14,20 20:3,19 21:18	3.3		
witness	29:12		8	
4:10 7:16 34:7,13,19	2011	800		
	22:2,10,13 23:17 24:13	3:8		
35:5,14,19 36:2,7 37:13	2016	3.0		
works	1:13 6:8 37:15			
20:22	2018			
work-related	37:18			
31:13 32:12	202			
wrote	2:8 3:10,19 4:8,17			
22:10 23:18	20520			
22:10 23:18	4:7			
X	20530			
X	3:18			
1:3,9 5:5	2201			
	4:6			
1	24			
1	1:13			
1:21 6:3	24th			
10:01	6:8 37:14			
1:14 6:9	27			
10:28	18:13,19			
36:11				
10:33	3			
36:14,19,20	30th			
121788	22:10 23:17 24:13			
1:20	37			
1299	1:21			
2:6 4:15 6:12				
13-cv-1363	4			
6:7	425			
13-cv-1363(EGS)	3:7			
1:7				
14	5			
37:18	514-2205			
17	3:19			
20:19				