



United States Department of State

Washington, D.C. 20520

FEB 11 2015

Case No.: F-2014-11262

Segments: S/ES-1 & S/ES-2

Ms. Kate Bailey
425 Third St., SW, Suite 800
Washington, DC 20024

Dear Ms. Bailey:

I refer to our letter dated December 17, 2014, regarding the release of certain Department of State material under the Freedom of Information Act (the "FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552.

The review has been completed for part 2 of the records retrieved from the Office of the Secretary, which consist of 16 documents responsive to your request. We have determined that nine may be released in full and seven may be released with excisions. All released material is enclosed.

An enclosure provides information on FOIA exemptions and other grounds for withholding material. Where we have made excisions, the applicable exemptions are marked on each document.

We will keep you informed as your case progresses. If you have any questions, you may contact Assistant United States Attorney Robert Prince at (202) 305-3654 or Robert.Prince@usdoj.gov. Please be sure to refer to the case number shown above in all correspondence about this case.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "John F. Hackett".

John F. Hackett, Acting Director
Office of Information Programs and Services

Enclosures: As stated.

FOIA Exemptions

(b)(1) Information specifically authorized by an executive order to be kept secret in the interest of national defense or foreign policy. Executive Order 13526 includes the following classification categories:

- 1.4(a) Military plans, systems, or operations
- 1.4(b) Foreign government information
- 1.4(c) Intelligence activities, sources or methods, or cryptology
- 1.4(d) Foreign relations or foreign activities of the US, including confidential sources
- 1.4(e) Scientific, technological, or economic matters relating to national security, including defense against transnational terrorism
- 1.4(f) U.S. Government programs for safeguarding nuclear materials or facilities
- 1.4(g) Vulnerabilities or capabilities of systems, installations, infrastructures, projects, plans, or protection services relating to US national security, including defense against transnational terrorism
- 1.4(h) Weapons of mass destruction

(b)(2) Related solely to the internal personnel rules and practices of an agency

(b)(3) Specifically exempted from disclosure by statute (other than 5 USC 552), for example:

ARMSEXP	Arms Export Control Act, 50a USC 2411(c)
CIA PERS/ORG	Central Intelligence Agency Act of 1949, 50 USC 403(g)
EXPORT CONTROL	Export Administration Act of 1979, 50 USC App. Sec. 2411(c)
FS ACT	Foreign Service Act of 1980, 22 USC 4004
INA	Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 USC 1202(f), Sec. 222(f)
IRAN	Iran Claims Settlement Act, Public Law 99-99, Sec. 505

(b)(4) Trade secrets and confidential commercial or financial information

(b)(5) Interagency or intra-agency communications forming part of the deliberative process, attorney-client privilege, or attorney work product

(b)(6) Personal privacy information

(b)(7) Law enforcement information whose disclosure would:

- (A) interfere with enforcement proceedings
- (B) deprive a person of a fair trial
- (C) constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy
- (D) disclose confidential sources
- (E) disclose investigation techniques
- (F) endanger life or physical safety of an individual

(b)(8) Prepared by or for a government agency regulating or supervising financial institutions

(b)(9) Geological and geophysical information and data, including maps, concerning wells

Other Grounds for Withholding

NR Material not responsive to a FOIA request excised with the agreement of the requester

RELEASED IN FULL

OBTAINED BY JUDICIAL WATCH, INC. VIA FOIA
REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior Reviewer

From: Sand, Maria W
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:07 PM
To: Mills, Cheryl D; Sullivan, Jacob J; Macmanus, Joseph E (S)
Cc: S_SpecialAssistants
Subject: FW: U.S. Diplomatic Mission in Benghazi Under Attack (SBU)

FYI

From: OpsAlert@state.gov [mailto:OpsAlert@state.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:06 PM
Subject: U.S. Diplomatic Mission in Benghazi Under Attack (SBU)

(SBU) The Regional Security Officer reports the diplomatic mission is under attack. Embassy Tripoli reports approximately 20 armed people fired shots; explosions have been heard as well. Ambassador Stevens, who is currently in Benghazi, and four COM personnel are in the compound safe haven. The 17th of February militia is providing security support.

The Operations Center will provide updates as available.

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

Classified by DAS, A/GIS, DoS 01/20/2015 ~ Class: CONFIDENTIAL ~ Reason: 1.4(B), 1.4(C)
 ~ Declassify on: 09/12/2027

From: Randolph, Lawrence M
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:42 PM
To: Macmanus, Joseph E (S)
Subject: FW: Attack on Benghazi 09112012

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
SensitivityCode: Sensitive

Joe- I spoke with NEA about the situation in Cairo and they said they will forward us situation reports. They didn't have more on Libya at the time so I forwarded this as it had more information than the Ops alert. Thanks, L

From: Randolph, Lawrence M
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:38 PM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Mills, Cheryl D; Macmanus, Joseph E (S)
Cc: S_SpecialAssistants
Subject: FW: Attack on Benghazi 09112012

RELEASED IN PART
 1.4(B),B6,1.4(C)

A little more detailed reporting on Benghazi. Ops is setting up a direct line with Benghazi so we should have more updates soon.

From: Bultrowicz, Scott P
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:32 PM
To: S_SpecialAssistants
Subject: FW: Attack on Benghazi 09112012
 Reporting from Benghazi

From: [REDACTED] On Behalf Of DS Command Center
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:22 PM
To: DSCC_C DS Seniors
Subject: Attack on Benghazi 09112012

B6

The following is preliminary information.

DSCC received a phone call from [REDACTED] in Benghazi, Libya initially stating the 15 armed individuals were attacking the compound and trying to gain entrance. The Ambassador is present in Benghazi and currently is barricaded within the compound. There are no injuries at this time and it is unknown what the intent of the attackers is. At approximately 1600 DSCC received word from Benghazi that individuals had entered the compound. At 1614 RSO advised that the Libyans had set fire to various buildings in the area, possibly the building that houses the Ambassador. [REDACTED] is responding and taking fire.

B6

1.4(B)
 1.4(C)

-DSCC

SBU
 This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior Reviewer

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

RELEASED IN PART B6

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior Reviewer

From: Randolph, Lawrence M
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 12:04 AM
To: Mills, Cheryl D; Macmanus, Joseph E (S); Sullivan, Jacob J
Cc: S_SpecialAssistants
Subject: FW: Update 3: Benghazi Shelter Location Also Under Attack (SBU)

Please excuse if you have seen this before or already heard this. I just called Ops and they said that DS command center is reporting that the compound is under attack again. I am about to reach out to the DS Command Center.

From: OpsAlert@state.gov [mailto:OpsAlert@state.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 11:57 PM
To: Milner, Christie E; SES_DutyDeputies; S_SpecialAssistants; D(B); D(N); P; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_R_DL; PA FO Group; Operations Center; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_S_ES-O_DL; SES-Line_Only; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_DS_DL; #whsr [redacted] B6
 harry.b.harris.mil@mail.mil; Benghazi Update; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_CA_DL; C; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_CSO_DL; CT_FrontOffice; D(B)/MET; MDGHR Front Office; DRL-FO-DL; sioc@ic.fbi.gov; H_SeniorStaff;
 Ops_Targeted_Alerts_INL_DL; INR-STAFFER; INR-Watch; Legal-Ops-Alert-DL; M_Staff; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_NEA_DL; OBO-Special Assistants-DL; PM-Alerts-DL; NEA-SEMEP-DL; A Front Office
Cc: Ops_Targeted_Alerts_DS_DL; #whsr [redacted] B6
Subject: Update 3: Benghazi Shelter Location Also Under Attack (SBU)

(SBU) DS Command reports the current shelter location for COM personnel in Benghazi is under attack by mortar fire. There are reports of injuries to COM staff.

From: OpsAlert@state.gov
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 6:06 PM
To: MilnerCE@state.gov; SES_DutyDeputies@State.gov; S_SpecialAssistants@state.gov; D-B@State.gov; D-N@State.gov; Poffice@State.gov; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_R_DL@state.gov; PAFOGroup@State.gov; OperationsCenter@State.gov; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_S_ES-O_DL@state.gov; SES-Line_Only@state.gov; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_DS_DL@State.gov; #whsr [redacted] harry.b.harris.mil@mail.mil; B6
 BenghaziUpdate@state.gov; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_CA_DL@state.gov; COffice@State.gov; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_CSO_DL@State.gov; CT_FrontOffice@State.gov; DB_MET@state.gov; MDGHRFrontOffice@State.gov; (DNI-ROC-Watch@dni.gov; DNI-ROC-Watch@newton.pentagon.mil); DRL-FO-DL@State.gov; sioc@ic.fbi.gov; H_SeniorStaff@state.gov;
 Ops_Targeted_Alerts_INL_DL@state.gov; INR-STAFFER@State.gov; INR-Watch@State.gov; Legal-Ops-Alert-DL@State.gov; M_Staff@State.gov; Ops_Targeted_Alerts_NEA_DL@state.gov; OBO-SpecialAssistants-DL@State.gov; PM-Alerts@State.gov; NEA-SEMEP-DL@State.gov; Afront@State.gov
CC: Ops_Targeted_Alerts_DS_DL@State.gov; #whsr [redacted] B6
Subject: Update 2: Ansar al-Sharia Claims Responsibility for Benghazi Attack (SBU)

(SBU) Embassy Tripoli reports the group claimed responsibility on Facebook and Twitter and has called for an attack on Embassy Tripoli.

From: OpsAlert@state.gov**Sent:** Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:54 PM

To: MilnerCE@state.gov; SES DutyDeputies@State.gov; S SpecialAssistants@state.gov; D-B@State.gov; D-N@State.gov; Poffice@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts R DL@state.gov; PAFOGroup@State.gov; OperationsCenter@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts S ES-O DL@state.gov; SES-Line Only@state.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts DS DL@State.gov; #whsr [redacted] harry.b.harris.mil@mail.mil; BenghaziUpdate@state.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts CA DL@state.gov; COffice@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts CSO DL@State.gov; CT FrontOffice@State.gov; DB MET@state.gov; MDGHRFrontOffice@State.gov; (DNI-ROC-Watch@dni.gov); DNI-ROC-Watch@newton.pentagon.mil; DRL-FO-DL@State.gov; sioc@ic.fbi.gov; H SeniorStaff@state.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts INL DL@state.gov; INR-STAFFER@State.gov; INR-Watch@State.gov; Legal-Ops-Alert-DL@State.gov; M Staff@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts NEA DL@state.gov; OBO-SpecialAssistants-DL@State.gov; PM-Alerts@State.gov; NEA-SEMEP-DL@State.gov; Afront@State.gov

CC: Ops Targeted Alerts DS DL@State.gov; #whsr [redacted]

Subject: Update 1: U.S. Diplomatic Mission in Benghazi (SBU)

(SBU) Embassy Tripoli reports the firing at the U.S. Diplomatic Mission in Benghazi has stopped and the compound has been cleared. A response team is on site attempting to locate COM personnel.

From: OpsAlert@state.gov**Sent:** Tuesday, September 11, 2012 4:05 PM

To: MilnerCE@state.gov; SES DutyDeputies@State.gov; S SpecialAssistants@state.gov; D-B@State.gov; D-N@State.gov; Poffice@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts R DL@state.gov; PAFOGroup@State.gov; OperationsCenter@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts S ES-O DL@state.gov; SES-Line Only@state.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts DS DL@State.gov; #whsr [redacted] harry.b.harris.mil@mail.mil; BenghaziUpdate@state.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts CA DL@state.gov; COffice@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts CSO DL@State.gov; CT FrontOffice@State.gov; DB MET@state.gov; MDGHRFrontOffice@State.gov; (DNI-ROC-Watch@dni.gov); DNI-ROC-Watch@newton.pentagon.mil; DRL-FO-DL@State.gov; sioc@ic.fbi.gov; H SeniorStaff@state.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts INL DL@state.gov; INR-STAFFER@State.gov; INR-Watch@State.gov; Legal-Ops-Alert-DL@State.gov; M Staff@State.gov; Ops Targeted Alerts NEA DL@state.gov; OBO-SpecialAssistants-DL@State.gov; PM-Alerts@State.gov; NEA-SEMEP-DL@State.gov; Afront@State.gov

CC: Ops Targeted Alerts DS DL@State.gov; #whsr [redacted]

Subject: U.S. Diplomatic Mission in Benghazi Under Attack (SBU)

(SBU) The Regional Security Officer reports the diplomatic mission is under attack. Embassy Tripoli reports approximately 20 armed people fired shots; explosions have been heard as well. Ambassador Stevens, who is currently in Benghazi, and four COM personnel are in the compound safe haven. The 17th of February militia is providing security support.

The Operations Center will provide updates as available.

RELEASED IN FULL

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
 Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA
 Reviewer

From: Blumenfeld, Joshua R
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 5:50 AM
To: Macmanus, Joseph E (S); Adams, David S
Subject: Re: Death of Ambassador Stevens in Benghazi

Bill Danvers just inquired based on the Reuters story, just fyi.

From: Macmanus, Joseph E (S)
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 05:36 AM
To: Adams, David S; Blumenfeld, Joshua R
Subject: Fw: Death of Ambassador Stevens in Benghazi

this is today's sad business. Do not forward to anyone at this point. You will see press reports and wanted you to think about Hill notifications and requests for briefings, etc.

From: Randolph, Lawrence M
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 03:35 AM
To: Mills, Cheryl D; Macmanus, Joseph E (S)
Cc: S_SpecialAssistants
Subject: Fw: Death of Ambassador Stevens in Benghazi

From: Veprek, Andrew M
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 03:22 AM
To: Sherman, Wendy R; Nides, Thomas R; Burns, William J; Nuland, Victoria J; Sullivan, Jacob J; Dibble, Elizabeth L; Maxwell, Raymond D; Sidereas, Evyenia; Roebuck, William V
Cc: NEA-Staff-Assistants-DL; S_SpecialAssistants; D(B); D(N); SES_DutyDeputies; SES-O_SWO; Leach, Kirk A
Subject: Death of Ambassador Stevens in Benghazi

Embassy Tripoli confirms the death of Ambassador John C. (Chris) Stevens in Benghazi. His body has been recovered and is at the airport in Benghazi.

Andrew M. Veprek
 Senior Watch Officer
 U.S. Department of State Operations Center
veprekam@state.gov; 202-647-1512

RELEASED IN FULL

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA
REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bulster, Senior Reviewer

From: Randolph, Lawrence M
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 8:16 AM
To: Macmanus, Joseph E (S)
Cc: S_SpecialAssistants
Subject: FW: Spot report - Libyan president and PM condemn consulate attack

Not sure if you saw this.

From: Powell, David R
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 8:08 AM
Subject: Spot report - Libyan president and PM condemn consulate attack

11.45gmt

Pan-Arab stations carried a joint news conference by **President of the Libyan National Assembly Mohammed Magariaf** and **Prime Minister Abdurrahim El-Keib** in which they both strongly condemned the attack on the consulate and expressed condolences to the United States.

Magariaf said:

- Libya will not be used as a place for "cowardly acts of vengeance" and Libya stands together with the United States in opposing outlaws.
- The attack coincided with other attacks by those opposed to the political process in Libya.
- The elections for the head of government will be held on schedule today.

=ends

RELEASED IN FULL

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior Reviewer

**Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton
Prepared Remarks on Events in Benghazi
September 12, 2012**

Yesterday, the U.S. diplomatic post in Benghazi, Libya was attacked. Heavily armed militants forced their way into the compound and set fire to our buildings. American and Libyan security personnel battled the attackers together. Four Americans were killed. They included Sean Smith, a Foreign Service information management officer, and our Ambassador to Libya, Chris Stevens. We are still making next of kin notifications for the other two individuals.

This is an attack that should shock the conscience of people of all faiths around the world. We condemn in the strongest terms this senseless act of violence, and we send our prayers to the families, friends and colleagues of those we've lost.

All over the world, every day, America's diplomats and development experts risk their lives in the service of our country and our values -- because they believe that the United States must be a force for peace and progress in the world ... that these aspirations are worth striving and sacrificing for. Alongside our men and women in uniform, they represent the best traditions of a bold and generous nation.

In the lobby of this building, the names of those who have fallen in the line of duty are inscribed in marble. Our hearts break over each one. And now, because of this tragedy, we have new heroes to honor, and more friends to mourn.

Chris Stevens fell in love with the Middle East as a young Peace Corps volunteer teaching English in Morocco. He joined the Foreign Service, learned languages, won friends for America in distant places, and made other people's hopes his own. In the early days of the Libyan revolution, Chris arrived on a cargo ship in the port of Benghazi and built our relationships with Libya's revolutionaries. He risked his life to stop a tyrant, then gave his life trying to help build a better Libya. The world needs more Chris Stevenses. I spoke with his sister Anne this morning, and told her that he will be remembered as a hero by many nations.

Sean Smith was an Air Force veteran. He spent ten years as an Information

Management Officer in the State Department. He was posted at the Hague, and was in Libya on a brief temporary assignment. He was a husband to a wonderful wife, Heather, with whom I spoke this morning. He was a father to two young children, Samantha and Nathan. They will grow up being proud of the service their father gave to our country – service that took him from Pretoria to Baghdad and finally to Benghazi.

The mission that drew Chris and Sean and their colleagues to Libya is both noble and necessary. And we and the people of Libya honor their memory by carrying it forward. This is not easy. Today, many Americans are asking—indeed, I asked myself—how could this happen? How could this happen in a country we helped liberate, in a city we helped save from destruction?

This question reflects just how complicated—and at times, how confounding—the world can be. But we must be clear-eyed, even in grief.

This was an attack by a small and savage group, not the people or government of Libya. Everywhere Chris and his team went in this country scarred by war and tyranny, they were hailed as friends and partners. And when the attack came, Libyans stood and fought to defend our post. Some were wounded. Libyans carried Chris's body to the hospital, and they helped other Americans reach safety.

And last night, when I spoke with the President of Libya, he strongly condemned the violence and pledged every effort to protect our people and pursue those responsible. The friendship between our countries, born out of shared struggle, will not be another casualty of this attack. A free and stable Libya is still in America's interest. And we will not turn our back on that.

Nor will we rest until those responsible for these attacks are found and brought to justice. We are working closely with the Libyan authorities to move swiftly and surely. We are also working with partners around the world to safeguard other American embassies, consulates, and citizens. There will be more time later to reflect—but today, we have work to do. There is no higher priority than protecting our men and women, wherever they serve.

We are working to determine the precise motivations and methods of those who carried out this assault. Some have sought to justify this vicious

behavior, along with the protest that took place at our embassy in Cairo yesterday, as a response to inflammatory material posted on the Internet. America's commitment to religious tolerance goes back to the very beginning of our nation. But let me be clear: There is no justification for this. None. Violence like this is no way to honor religion or faith. And as long as there are those who would take innocent life in the name of God, the world will never know a true and lasting peace.

It is especially difficult that this happened on September 11th. It's an anniversary that means a great deal to all Americans. Every year on that day, we are reminded that our work is not yet finished—that the job of putting an end to violent extremism and building a safe and stable world continues. But September 11th means even more than that. It is a day on which we remember thousands of American heroes... the bonds that connect all Americans, wherever we are on earth... and the values that see us through every storm. And now, it is a day on which we remember Sean, Chris, and their colleagues.

May God bless them. May God bless the thousands of Americans working in every corner of the world, who make this country the greatest force for peace, prosperity and human dignity the world has ever known. And may God bless the United States of America.

###

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

RELEASED IN FULL

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

From: Nuland, Victoria J
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 12:15 AM
To: Mills, Cheryl D; Sullivan, Jacob J; Kennedy, Patrick F; Reines, Philippe I
Subject: Re: Off the Record

Yes. Fyi, my msg was that S statement was authoritative.

From: Mills, Cheryl D
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 12:11 AM
To: Nuland, Victoria J; Sullivan, Jacob J; Kennedy, Patrick F; Reines, Philippe I
Subject: RE: Off the Record

Can we stop answering emails for the night Toria b/c now the first one is hanging out there.

From: Nuland, Victoria J
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 12:06 AM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Mills, Cheryl D; Kennedy, Patrick F; Reines, Philippe I
Subject: Re: Off the Record

+ PIR

From: Nuland, Victoria J
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 12:05 AM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Mills, Cheryl D; Kennedy, Patrick F
Subject: Fw: Off the Record

Fysa - first press q abt Chris' whereabouts.

I ignored it and just dealt w the second ...

From: Brennan, Margaret [<mailto:BrennanM@cbsnews.com>]
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 11:45 PM
To: Nuland, Victoria J; Ventrell, Patrick H
Subject: RE: Off the Record

Two questions:

- 1) Is the US ambassador in Libya secure and does State know his whereabouts?
- 2) Does the State Dept standby the earlier statements made by the US Embassy in Cairo? The Secretary's statement on Libya suggests that State is uncomfortable with the characterization used in that earlier statement but doesn't explicitly 'disavow' some of the tweets/release from the embassy.

Some have sought to justify this vicious behavior as a response to inflammatory material posted on the Internet. The United States deplores any intentional effort to denigrate the religious beliefs of others. Our commitment to religious tolerance goes back to the very beginning of our nation. But let me be clear: There is never any justification for violent acts of this kind.

From: Brennan, Margaret
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 10:53 PM
To: Nuland, Victoria J; Ventrell, Patrick H
Subject: RE: Off the Record

I see the emailed statement from the S. Thanks. I'm sorry to hear about your colleague. I'm sorry to hear about your colleague.

I also see the statement on the website about the incident at the US Embassy in Egypt.

M

From: Nuland, Victoria J [nulandvj@state.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 10:21 PM
To: Brennan, Margaret; Ventrell, Patrick H
Subject: RE: Off the Record

You saw S statement? Htat's it for tonite. We'll see where we are in am.

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

From: Brennan, Margaret [mailto:BrennanM@cbsnews.com]
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 9:13 PM
To: Ventrell, Patrick H; Nuland, Victoria J
Subject: Re: Off the Record

Will we get any information regarding the US employee who was killed in Benghazi attack? Is there only one fatality and is he/she a US national

From: Ventrell, Patrick H [mailto:VentrellPH@state.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, September 11, 2012 07:31 PM
To: Ventrell, Patrick H <VentrellPH@state.gov>; Nuland, Victoria J <nulandvj@state.gov>
Subject: Off the Record

Bullpen colleagues,

OFF THE RECORD

Situation in Benghazi very fluid. Hearing conflicting reports. We will share what we can as soon as we can.

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

RELEASED IN FULL

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

From: Veprek, Andrew M
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 3:23 AM
To: Sherman, Wendy R; Nides, Thomas R; Burns, William J; Nuland, Victoria J; Sullivan, Jacob J; Dibble, Elizabeth L; Maxwell, Raymond D; Sidereas, Evyenia; Roebuck, William V
Cc: NEA-Staff-Assistants-DL; S_SpecialAssistants; D(B); D(N); SES_DutyDeputies; SES-O_SWO; Leach, Kirk A
Subject: Death of Ambassador Stevens in Benghazi

Embassy Tripoli confirms the death of Ambassador John C. (Chris) Stevens in Benghazi. His body has been recovered and is at the airport in Benghazi.

Andrew M. Veprek
Senior Watch Officer
U.S. Department of State Operations Center
veprekam@state.gov; 202-647-1512

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

RELEASED IN FULL

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

From: Sherman, Wendy R
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 10:29 AM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Nuland, Victoria J; Reines, Philippe I; Mills, Cheryl D; Kennedy, Patrick F;
Nides, Thomas R; Burns, William J
Subject: FW: Libyan statements
Importance: High
Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
SMARTCategory: Working

FYI

From: Dibble, Elizabeth L
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 10:22 AM
To: Sherman, Wendy R; Lakhdhir, Kamala S; Zeya, Uzra S; S_SpecialAssistants; Nuland, Victoria J
Cc: Jones, Beth E; Miller, James N; Roebuck, William V; Maxwell, Raymond D
Subject: Libyan statements
Importance: High

Wendy – we just confirmed with Greg Hicks in Tripoli that the Libyan President and PM did a joint press availability and issued what Greg called a “strong statement.” We are tracking down the full text now and will send it around. Beth had spoken to Libyan Amb Aujuli here in DC a few minutes before (and before we learned of the statement from Tripoli) and strongly encouraged him to have his gov’t issue something robust.

Liz

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

RELEASED IN FULL

From: Posner, Michael H
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 1:34 PM
To: Sherman, Wendy R; Sullivan, Jacob J
Subject: FW: Rabbi Saperstein "Saddened and Appalled" by Tragic Violence in Libya, Egypt

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
SMARTCategory: Working

This is an excellent statement – our goal should be to get the Conference of Presidents, ADL etc to follow suit and use similar language

Rabbi Saperstein "Saddened and Appalled" by Tragic Violence in Libya, Egypt

Contact: Sean Thibault or Benny Witkovsky
202.387.2800 | news@rac.org

WASHINGTON, D.C., September 12, 2012 -- In response to the recent violence in Egypt and Libya, and the deaths of Ambassador Chris Stevens and three other US embassy staff, Rabbi David Saperstein, Director of the Religious Action Center of Reform Judaism, issued the following statement:

"I am saddened and appalled this morning to learn of the deaths of Ambassador Chris Stevens and three members of the U.S. consulate staff in Benghazi. I offer our deepest condolences and sympathies to the families of those killed. This act of violence, and the similarly threatening violence at the U.S. embassy in Cairo, must be condemned unequivocally. The losses of life in this manner are an affront to the values of humanity and tolerance that are at the core of Judaism, Christianity and Islam.

I also stand here today to condemn the video that apparently spurred these incidents. It was clearly crafted to provoke, to offend, and to evoke outrage. The denigration of religion and religious figures and the intentional framing of religious texts and tenets in this manner must likewise be condemned.

The video and the views it espouses do not reflect the views of the overwhelming majority of Americans and people of faith. It is, purely and simply, a creation of those on the fringes of American society whether they are Christians or Jews or Muslims. I appeal to the religious leaders and to the media in the Muslim world to make that message clear and help bring an end to the violence before further tragedy occurs. Two years ago, it was Evangelical leaders who persuaded Terry Jones from burning the Koran. And it was the leaders of all the major religions in America that expressed universal condemnation of such religious hatred - in that case as now, anti-Muslim hatred.

We must oppose efforts to divide people - in the United States, in Egypt, Libya and around the world - along religious lines. Small violent groups of extremists, no matter their religious identity, cannot be allowed to define their religions or their nations. Instead, let us lift up those who appeal to the best in humanity, those who seek to build bridges over longstanding divides, and those who speak the language of peace and tolerance."

###

The Religious Action Center of Reform Judaism is the Washington office of the Union for Reform Judaism, whose more than 900 congregations across North America encompass 1.5 million Reform Jews, and the Central Conference of American Rabbis, whose membership includes more than 1,800 Reform rabbis. Visit www.rac.org for more.

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

RELEASED IN FULL

From: Reines, Philippe I
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 7:56 PM
To: Mills, Cheryl D; Kennedy, Patrick F
Cc: Sullivan, Jacob J
Subject: AP re Cause of Death & Treatment

Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
SMARTCategory: Working
SMARTClassificationData:

```
<?xml version="1.0"?>
<ClassificationMarkings xmlns:xsi="http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema-instance"
xmlns:xsd="http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema"
xmlns="http://SmartMessage.State.Gov/v1">
  <Classification xmlns="">
    <UserID />
    <Title />
    <Reason />
    <ClassificationCode>UNCLASSIFIED</ClassificationCode>
    <Authority>OCA</Authority>
    <ClassificationDate>0001-01-01</ClassificationDate>
    <Agency />
    <Office />
    <ClassificationType>UN</ClassificationType>
    <NATO>false</NATO>
  </Classification>
  <MessageType xmlns="">NEWWORKING</MessageType>
  <ClassificationType xmlns="">EVENT</ClassificationType>
  <ClassificationWithoutAttachments xmlns="">
    UNCLASSIFIED</ClassificationWithoutAttachments>
  <ClassificationWithAttachments xmlns="">UNCLASSIFIED</ClassificationWithAttachments>
  <Reasons />
  <IsNoform>false</IsNoform>
  <IsCorrectedCopy>false</IsCorrectedCopy>
  <EoLine />
  <IsVerified>false</IsVerified>
  <ShowMarkings>true</ShowMarkings>
  <RetainClassification>true</RetainClassification>
  <IsInitialized>true</IsInitialized>
</ClassificationMarkings>
```

Here is an AP interview with the person claiming to be Chris's doctor. In a separate BBC interview, he was asked whether he could have been saved if he had been brought into the hospital faster, he said: "Yes, yes, yes he would have survived... there were no injuries on his body. He only suffocated from carbon monoxide and from smoke".

Chris Stevens Dead: Libya Ambassador Died Of Asphyxia, Doctor Says

By ESAM MOHAMED and MAGGIE MICHAEL

Associated Press

9/12/12

TRIPOLI, Libya -- The Libyan doctor who treated U.S. ambassador Chris Stevens says the diplomat died of severe asphyxiation and that he tried for 90 minutes to revive him.

Ziad Abu Zeid told The Associated Press on Wednesday that Stevens was brought to the Benghazi Medical Center by Libyans the night before, with no other Americans and that initially no one realized he was the ambassador.

Abu Zeid said Stevens had "severe asphyxia," apparently from smoke inhalation, causing stomach bleeding, but had no other injuries.

Stevens and three American security guards died when the U.S. Consulate in Benghazi came under attack from a mob angry over an anti-Islam film made in the U.S. The crowd fired guns and rocket-propelled grenades and set fire to the consulate.

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

RELEASED IN PART B6

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

From: Cohen, David <David_Z_Cohen [REDACTED]>
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 1:14 PM
To: Cohen, David
Subject: Presidential Proclamation -- Honoring the Victims of the Attack in Benghazi, Libya
Attachments: 2012libyaconsulateamer.prc.rel.pdf

B6

Dear Chiefs of Staff:

Please see attached a Presidential Proclamation honoring the victims of the attack in Benghazi, Libya. Please note that the President directs that the U.S. flag be flown at half-staff until sunset on September 16.

Thank you.

--Cabinet Affairs

THE WHITE HOUSE
Office of the Press Secretary

FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE
September 12, 2012

Attached is a proclamation signed by the President today honoring the victims of the attack in Benghazi, Libya.

###

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

RELEASED IN PART B6

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

From: Kim Ghattas <kim.ghattas@ [REDACTED]>
Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 2:18 PM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Reines, Philippe I
Subject: Bbc interview w doctor who treated Chris

B6

You may have this already but just incase.

Tim Franks has just interviewed the Benghazi Medical Centre doctor Ziad Abu Zeid, who treated the US Ambassador when he arrived at hospital last night.

He says:

He didn't know it was the Ambassador.

The doctor started CPR, but there was no response. He continued for almost an hour.

What injuries did the patient have? Effects of smoke inhalation and carbon monoxide poisoning. He suffocated.

The patient was brought in and left at the hospital.

Do you think that Mr Stevens might have survived if he had been brought out more quickly? "Yes, yes, yes he would have survived", he said, adding that "there were no injuries on his body. He only suffocated from carbon monoxide and from smoke".

Sent via BlackBerry from T-Mobile

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

RELEASED IN PART B6

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster,
Senior Reviewer

From: Himes, Linda <ldhimes@ [redacted]>
Sent: Thursday, September 13, 2012 2:38 PM
To: 'Alhassani, Mehdi K.'; 'Valliani, Amira'; 'McAuliffe, Marisa S'; Chang, Cindy; Shapiro, Nicholas S.; Krenzy, Caroline; 'Redden, Kaleb CIV OSD POLICY'; 'Culberson, Stephanie CTR OSD POLICY'; 'Scharre, Paul D CIV OSD-POLICY'; 'Hand, Bailey CIV SD'; 'Robles, Justo CIV SD'; 'Wishert, David GySgt JCS VDJS'; 'Bolson, Richard W CIV JCS J5'; 'Myers, Ross CAPT OVCJCS'; 'Chen, Janice LTC OVCJCS'; 'sandsrj@dni.gov'; 'JAMESHL@dni.gov'; 'jemelygt@dni.gov'; 'blondbm@nctc.gov'; Haines, Avril; Hattan, Justin D.; Fishman, Benjamin I.; Rhodes, Benjamin J.; Govashiri, Ferial; 'margema@nctc.gov'; 'Morell_staff@ucia.gov'; 'krista.l.mejia.civ@mail.mil'; 'simon, steven N'; Mujica, Maryam; NSC Deputy Press Secretary; Meehan, Bernadette; Wang, Jenny; Kahan, Alex; Blinken, Tony; Lundeberg, Greta; 'DIREAs@ucia.gov'; 'Kerry.Ghysen@ic.fbi.gov'; Lyle, Ellen; DeParle, Nancy-Ann; Updegrove, Laura; Blake, Randy; Wang, Jenny; 'Monaco, Lisa (NSD)'; Toiv, Nora F; Laszczyc, Joanne; Sullivan, Jacob J; Zafar, Shaarik; Din, Susan W; 'Monaco, Lisa (NSD)'; 'John.Carlin@usdoj.gov'; 'Kevin.Westberg@usdoj.gov'; 'JCC@usdoj.gov'; Ryu, Rexon Y; 'krista.l.mejia.civ@mail.mil'
Cc: Canegallo, Kristie A.; Strickler, Adam; Juska, Monika; [redacted]
Subject: RE: Libya SVTC TOMORROW 7:15am

Mr. Inglis will attend Mehdi.

Our Comms folks will be in contact with your folks.

Thanks – Linda

LINDA D. HIMES

Email: ldhimes@ [redacted]

From: Alhassani, Mehdi K. [mailto:Mehdi.K.Alhassani@ [redacted]]
Sent: Thursday, September 13, 2012 2:01 PM
To: Alhassani, Mehdi K.; 'Valliani, Amira'; 'McAuliffe, Marisa S'; Chang, Cindy; Shapiro, Nicholas S.; Krenzy, Caroline; 'Redden, Kaleb CIV OSD POLICY'; 'Culberson, Stephanie CTR OSD POLICY'; 'Scharre, Paul D CIV OSD-POLICY'; 'Hand, Bailey CIV SD'; 'Robles, Justo CIV SD'; 'Wishert, David GySgt JCS VDJS'; 'Bolson, Richard W CIV JCS J5'; 'Myers, Ross CAPT OVCJCS'; 'Chen, Janice LTC OVCJCS'; 'Robert.Cardillo@dni.gov'; 'sandsrj@dni.gov'; 'JAMESHL@dni.gov'; 'jemelygt@dni.gov'; 'blondbm@nctc.gov'; Haines, Avril; Hattan, Justin D.; Fishman, Benjamin I.; Rhodes, Benjamin J.; Govashiri, Ferial; 'margema@nctc.gov'; 'Morell_staff@ucia.gov'; 'krista.l.mejia.civ@mail.mil'; Simon, Steven; Mujica, Maryam; Vietor, Tommy; Meehan, Bernadette; Wang, Jenny; Kahan, Alex; Blinken, Tony; Lundeberg, Greta; 'DIREAs@ucia.gov'; 'Kerry.Ghysen@ic.fbi.gov'; Lyle, Ellen; DeParle, Nancy-Ann; Updegrove, Laura; Blake, Randy; Wang, Jenny; 'Monaco, Lisa (NSD)'; Himes, Linda; Toiv, Nora F; 'LaszczycJ@state.gov'; 'Sullivan, Jacob J'; Zafar, Shaarik; 'Din, Susan W'; 'Monaco, Lisa (NSD)'; 'John.Carlin@usdoj.gov'; 'Kevin.Westberg@usdoj.gov'; 'JCC@usdoj.gov'; Ryu, Rexon Y; 'krista.l.mejia.civ@mail.mil'
Cc: Canegallo, Kristie A.; Strickler, Adam; Juska, Monika; [redacted]
Subject: RE: Libya SVTC TOMORROW 7:15am

All,

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

As discussed in today's meeting, this group will meet again **TOMORROW, September 14, at 7:15am**. Please make sure to confirm your participation and where you plan to SVTC from. Thanks very much – Mehdi

Invited Participants

Sullivan + Team
 Mills
 Brennan
 Embassy Tripoli
 Miller
 Monaco
 Winnefeld
 Ryu
 Cardillo
 NCTC
 Joyce/ Giuliano
 DeParle
 Morell
 Haines
 Blinken
 Fishman
 Zafar
 Rhodes/ Vietor
 Lundeberg
 Simon
 Blake
 Intel

From: Alhassani, Mehdi K.

Sent: Wednesday, September 12, 2012 6:03 PM

To: Alhassani, Mehdi K.; 'Valliani, Amira'; 'McAuliffe, Marisa S'; Chang, Cindy; Shapiro, Nicholas S.; Krenzy, Caroline; 'Redden, Kaleb CIV OSD POLICY'; 'Culberson, Stephanie CTR OSD POLICY'; 'Scharre, Paul D CIV OSD-POLICY'; 'Hand, Bailey CIV SD'; 'Robles, Justo CIV SD'; 'Wishert, David GySgt JCS VDJ'; 'Bolson, Richard W CIV JCS J5'; 'Myers, Ross CAPT OVCJCS'; 'Chen, Janice LTC OVCJCS'; 'Robert.Cardillo@dni.gov'; 'sandsrj@dni.gov'; 'JAMESHL@dni.gov'; 'jemelygt@dni.gov'; 'blondbm@nctc.gov'; Haines, Avril; Hattan, Justin D.; Fishman, Benjamin I.; Rhodes, Benjamin J.; Govashiri, Ferial; 'margema@nctc.gov'; 'Morell_staff@ucia.gov'; 'krista.l.mejia.civ@mail.mil'; Simon, Steven; Mujica, Maryam; Vietor, Tommy; Meehan, Bernadette; Wang, Jenny; Kahan, Alex; Blinken, Tony; Lundeberg, Greta; 'DIREAs@ucia.gov'; 'Kerry.Ghysen@ic.fbi.gov'; Lyle, Ellen; DeParle, Nancy-Ann; Updegrove, Laura; Blake, Randy; Wang, Jenny; 'Monaco, Lisa (NSD)'; 'Himes, Linda'; 'Toiv, Nora F'; 'LaszczychJ@state.gov'; 'Sullivan, Jacob J'; Zafar, Shaarik
Cc: Canegallo, Kristie A.; Strickler, Adam; Juska, Monika; [REDACTED]
Subject: Libya SVTC TOMORROW 7:15am

B6

Hello,

As was discussed in today's meeting, we will host another **Libya SVTC TOMORROW 7:15am** (please note the, we will be starting 15 mins later than was said in meeting). The list of invited participants is below. Please confirm your participation and let me know if you have any questions. Thanks very much – Mehdi

Invited Participants

Sullivan + Team
 Mills
 Brennan
 Embassy Tripoli

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

Miller
Monaco
Winnefeld
Ryu
Cardillo
NCTC
Joyce/ Giuliano
DeParle
Morell
Haines
Blinken
Fishman
Rhodes/ Vietor
Lundeberg
Simon
Blake
Intel

Mehdi K. Alhassani
National Security Council

B6

RELEASED IN PART B5, B6

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

From: Kennedy, Patrick F
Sent: Thursday, September 13, 2012 9:13 PM
To: Boswell, Eric J; Sullivan, Jacob J; Nuland, Victoria J
Cc: Reines, Philippe I
Subject: RE: (No Subject)

Toria/Jake/Philippe

pat

From: Boswell, Eric J
Sent: Thursday, September 13, 2012 8:32 PM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Nuland, Victoria J
Cc: Reines, Philippe I; Kennedy, Patrick F
Subject: RE: (No Subject)

From: Sullivan, Jacob J
Sent: Thursday, September 13, 2012 8:26 PM
To: Boswell, Eric J; Nuland, Victoria J
Cc: Reines, Philippe I; Kennedy, Patrick F
Subject: RE: (No Subject)

From: Boswell, Eric J
Sent: Thursday, September 13, 2012 8:24 PM
To: Nuland, Victoria J
Cc: Reines, Philippe I; Sullivan, Jacob J; Kennedy, Patrick F
Subject: RE: (No Subject)

B5

From: Nuland, Victoria J**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2012 8:18 PM**To:** 'Shawn.Turner@dni.gov'; NSC Deputy Press Secretary; Sullivan, Jacob J; 'Benjamin_J._Rhodes@
Reines, Philippe I; 'Bernadette_M_Meehan@
'cynthlr@ucia.gov'; 'jennyb@ucia.gov'**Cc:** Boswell, Eric J**Subject:** Re: (No Subject)

B6

B6

B5

From: Shawn.Turner@dni.gov [mailto:Shawn.Turner@dni.gov]**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2012 08:12 PM**To:** NSC Deputy Press Secretary; Nuland, Victoria J; Sullivan, Jacob J; Benjamin J. Rhodes@
<Benjamin_J._Rhodes@
<Bernadette_M_Meehan@
<Bernadette_M_Meehan@
<cynthlr@ucia.gov <cynthlr@ucia.gov>; jennyb@ucia.gov <jennyb@ucia.gov>**Subject:** Re: (No Subject)

B6

B6

B6

B5

From: Vietor, Tommy [mailto:Thomas.F.Vietor@
<Thomas.F.Vietor@
<Thomas.F.Vietor@**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2012 08:05 PM**To:** 'Victoria Nuland' <nulandvi@state.gov>; 'Jake Sullivan' <SullivanJJ@state.gov>; Rhodes, Benjamin J.
<Benjamin_J._Rhodes@
<Philippe Reines' <ReinesP@state.gov>; Meehan, Bernadette
<Bernadette_M_Meehan@
>; Cynthia L Rapp; JENNIYB; Shawn S Turner**Subject:** FW: (No Subject)

B6

B6

B6

B5

-----Original Message-----

From: Mike Allen [mallen@politico.com]**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2012 07:52 PM Eastern Standard Time**To:** Vietor, Tommy**Subject:**<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/politics/revealed-inside-story-of-us-envoys-assassination-8135797.html?printService=print>
Revealed: inside story of US envoy's assassination

Exclusive: America 'was warned of embassy attack but did nothing'

Kim Sengupta

Friday, 14 September 2012

The killings of the US ambassador to Libya and three of his staff were likely to have been the result of a serious and continuing security breach, The Independent can reveal.

American officials believe the attack was planned, but Chris Stevens had been back in the country only a short while and the details of his visit to Benghazi, where he and his staff died, were meant to be confidential.

The US administration is now facing a crisis in Libya. Sensitive documents have gone missing from the consulate in Benghazi and the supposedly secret location of the "safe house" in the city, where the staff had retreated, came under sustained mortar attack. Other such refuges across the country are no longer deemed "safe".

Some of the missing papers from the consulate are said to list names of Libyans who are working with Americans, putting them potentially at risk from extremist groups, while some of the other documents are said to relate to oil contracts.

According to senior diplomatic sources, the US State Department had credible information 48 hours before mobs charged the consulate in Benghazi, and the embassy in Cairo, that American missions may be targeted, but no warnings were given for diplomats to go on high alert and "lockdown", under which movement is severely restricted.

Mr Stevens had been on a visit to Germany, Austria and Sweden and had just returned to Libya when the Benghazi trip took place with the US embassy's security staff deciding that the trip could be undertaken safely.

Eight Americans, some from the military, were wounded in the attack which claimed the lives of Mr Stevens, Sean Smith, an information officer, and two US Marines. All staff from Benghazi have now been moved to the capital, Tripoli, and those whose work is deemed to be non-essential may be flown out of Libya.

In the meantime a Marine Corps FAST Anti-Terrorism Reaction Team has already arrived in the country from a base in Spain and other personnel are believed to be on the way. Additional units have been put on standby to move to other states where their presence may be needed in the outbreak of anti-American fury triggered by publicity about a film which demeaned the Prophet Mohamed.

A mob of several hundred stormed the US embassy in the Yemeni capital Sanaa yesterday. Other missions which have been put on special alert include almost all those in the Middle East, as well as in Pakistan, Afghanistan, Armenia, Burundi and Zambia.

Senior officials are increasingly convinced, however, that the ferocious nature of the Benghazi attack, in which rocket-propelled grenades were used, indicated it was not the result of spontaneous anger due to the video, called Innocence of Muslims. Patrick Kennedy, Under-Secretary at the State Department, said he was convinced the assault was planned due to its extensive nature and the proliferation of weapons.

There is growing belief that the attack was in revenge for the killing in a drone strike in Pakistan of Mohammed Hassan Qaed, an al-Qa'ida operative who was, as his nom-de-guerre Abu Yahya al-Libi suggests, from Libya, and timed for the anniversary of the 11 September attacks.

Senator Bill Nelson, a member of the Senate Intelligence Committee, said: "I am asking my colleagues on the committee to immediately investigate what role al-Qa'ida or its affiliates may have played in the attack and to take appropriate action."

According to security sources the consulate had been given a "health check" in preparation for any violence connected to the 9/11 anniversary. In the event, the perimeter was breached within 15 minutes of an angry crowd starting to attack it at around 10pm on Tuesday night. There was, according to witnesses, little defence put up by the 30 or more local guards meant to protect the staff. Ali Feteri, a 59-year-old accountant who lives near by, said: "The security people just all ran away and the people in charge were the young men with guns and bombs."

Wissam Buhmeid, the commander of the Tripoli government-sanctioned Libya's Shield Brigade, effectively a police force for Benghazi, maintained that it was anger over the Mohamed video which made the guards abandon their post. "There were definitely people from the security forces who let the attack happen because they were themselves offended by the film; they would absolutely put their loyalty to the Prophet over the consulate. The deaths are all nothing compared to insulting the Prophet."

Mr Stevens, it is believed, was left in the building by the rest of the staff after they failed to find him in dense smoke caused by a blaze which had engulfed the building. He was discovered lying unconscious by local people and taken to a hospital, the Benghazi Medical Centre, where, according to a doctor, Ziad Abu Ziad, he died from smoke inhalation.

An eight-strong American rescue team was sent from Tripoli and taken by troops under Captain Fathi al-Obeidi, of the February 17 Brigade, to the secret safe house to extract around 40 US staff. The building then came under fire from heavy weapons. "I don't know how they found the place to carry out the attack. It was planned, the accuracy with which the mortars hit us was too good for any ordinary revolutionaries," said Captain Obeidi. "It began to rain down on us, about six mortars fell directly on the path to the villa."

Libyan reinforcements eventually arrived, and the attack ended. News had arrived of Mr Stevens, and his body was picked up from the

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

hospital and taken back to Tripoli with the other dead and the survivors.

Mr Stevens' mother, Mary Commanday, spoke of her son yesterday. "He did love what he did, and he did a very good job with it. He could have done a lot of other things, but this was his passion. I have a hole in my heart," she said.

Obtained by Judicial Watch, Inc. via FOIA

REVIEW AUTHORITY: Archie Bolster, Senior
Reviewer

RELEASED IN PART B6

From: Nuland, Victoria J
Sent: Friday, September 14, 2012 12:53 PM
To: Sullivan, Jacob J; Mills, Cheryl D; Kennedy, Patrick F; Boswell, Eric J
Subject: Fw: Fathi Baja Libyan professor who had breakfast with slain US ambassador Chris Stevens on the day of his death, criticizes Consulate Benghazi Security

B6

From: PA Clips [<mailto:paclips@state.gov>]

Sent: Friday, September 14, 2012 12:33 PM

To: PA-Monitoring-Group-DL; NEA-Press-DL; CAPRESSREQUESTS; DS PA Media

Subject: BBC: Fathi Baja Libyan professor who had breakfast with slain US ambassador Chris Stevens on the day of his death, criticizes Consulate Benghazi Security

BBC: 1626: Fathi Baja Libyan professor who had breakfast with slain US ambassador Chris Stevens on the day of his death told the BBC: "The security [at the consulate] was not enough. I was there in the morning with Chris around 0915 having breakfast but the security was not just insufficient, there was a big lack of security. He had 4 Libyans, 2 of them in front of the door and 2 inside the small room by the fence. It was very normal security measurements as if you were going to a hotel."

DGH